



THE JACOB RADER MARCUS CENTER OF THE
AMERICAN JEWISH ARCHIVES

MS-763: Rabbi Herbert A. Friedman Collection, 1930-2004.

Series I: Wexner Heritage Foundation, 1947-2004.

Subseries 1: General Files, 1949-2004.

Box
62

Folder
14

"Dual Identity: Living in Two Worlds." Cleveland and Columbus,
Ohio classes. 1993.

For more information on this collection, please see the finding aid on the
American Jewish Archives website.

The Wexner Heritage Foundation

551 Madison Avenue
New York, New York 10022
212 355 6115
Fax 212 751 3739

Huntington Center Suite 3710
41 South High Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
614 464 2772

August 18, 1993

TO: RABBI HERBERT A. FRIEDMAN
FROM: RABBI RAMIE ARIAN
DIRECTOR OF PROGRAMS
RE: "DUAL IDENTITY" CLASSES

This is the material that was sent to the members for your sessions on "Dual Identity":

Tuesday, September 7 -- Columbus

Wednesday, September 22 -- Cleveland I

Thursday, September 23 -- Cleveland II

The members were sent the following books for use in the readings:

Mendes-Flohr & Reinharz, The Jew in the Modern World.

Meyer, Jewish Identity in the Modern World.

Gilbert, Jewish History Atlas.

WEXNER HERITAGE FOUNDATION

Rabbi Herbert Friedman

Columbus/ 1993-1994 Academic Year

Session #1: DUAL IDENTITY
Living in Two Worlds

This session will deal with how we became American-Jewish and how we are continuously improving our ability to live creatively with both our nationality and our peoplehood.

Outline:

I. EMANCIPATION

- (1) Tolerance, (1779) which grew into
- (2) Citizenship, (1806 ff), which grew into
- (3) Political Equality (1858)

II. SELF-DEFINITION

- (1) Two hundred years ago, we said "We are a religion only"
-- Napoleonic Sanhedrin
- (2) Today, we define ourselves as "Peoplehood and Civilization"
-- M. Kaplan & Zionism

III. THE BALANCING ACT

- (1) Reconciling American nationality with Jewish nationhood, or
- (2) Living in two Worlds

Readings:

Lessing - Parable of Three Rings - p. 57

I. EMANCIPATION:

- Mendes-Flohr and Reinhartz, The Jew in the Modern World,
Citizenship:
"Answers to Napoleon" pp. 116-121
Political Equality:
"The Jewish Relief Act" pp. 137-138

II. SELF-DEFINITION:

- Plaut, The Growth of Reform Judaism,
pp. 31-41; 96-100
- Meyer, Jewish Identity in the Modern World,
pp. 33-85
- Karp, Haven and Home,
pp. 360-373

III. MAPS

- Gilbert, Jewish History Atlas,
Please refer to the Maps on pages 58 & 59:
Napoleon and the Jews
The Emancipation of European Jewry, 1789-1816

Questions and Issues to consider while reading:

THE BALANCING ACT

1. How can we maintain a strong sense of Jewish identity, while living in a free permissive society as absolutely equal Americans?
 2. How do we prevent a deterioration of values, so that we don't descend to the lowest common denominator of ideal-less, mind-less materialistic mores?
 3. How do we teach our children the best and highest aspects of American culture and at the same time the full richness of the Jewish heritage?
 4. How do we grow from mere "survivalists" to a full Jewish "creative society"?
 5. How do we relate ourselves to Israel in a manner which benefits both her and us?
-

Cultural Literacy Terms (that will be discussed this class)
Section VI:#1-3; Section IX:#7-10; 41-42; 52-53

Emancipation

"The Jews Should be Denied Everything as a Nation, but Granted
Everything as Individuals"

Napoleonic Sanhedrin

HUC -- Hebrew Union College 1875

Pittsburgh Platform 1885

Columbus Platform 1937

JTS -- Jewish Theological Seminary

Mordecai Kaplan -- Reconstructionism

Judaism as a Civilization

Assimilation

Intermarriage



Letty Cottin Pogrebin

"To have Jewish grandchildren you either move to Israel where your children are most likely to meet, date and mate with Jews - or you stay in the Diaspora and fill their hearts and heads with Jewish things so they will choose to live as Jews regardless of the seductions of North American life."



I. ENLIGHTENMENT - 17TH & 18TH CENTURY

1. Isaac Newton - laws of physics opened physical universe
2. John Locke - mind working through reason.
3. Immanuel Kant - mankind assume responsibility (not God) through intellect and reason.

Fierce Wars of Religion - 1560-1648 - Catholics vs. Protestants

Relative Peace - 1648-1789 (French Revolution)
Liberté Egalité Fraternité

Enlightenment proposed:

Religious toleration
Economic growth
Peace
Development of states

II. HOLY ROMAN EMPEROR JOSEPH II - EDICT OF TOLERATION - 1781

Offered toleration to Jews in return for regeneration, which meant: occupational restructuring (minimize money-lending and go into useful occupations); speak vernacular languages; change social manners, dress, etc. provide secular education; give up self-government (schools, courts, taxes, welfare system).

III. MOSES MENDELSON - MOST FAMOUS JEW

Accepted this contract; worked for equal rights for Jews; 1781 wrote "On the Civil Amelioration of the Condition of the Jews"; translated Torah into German

IV. FRENCH REVOLUTION & EMANCIPATION FOR JEWS - 1789-1791

1. In National Assembly, Count Clermont-Tonné:
"The Jews should be denied everything as a nation, but granted everything as individuals."
2. Voltaire opposed.
3. On 27 September 1791 Jews gained rights of citizenship, and next day The National Assembly stipulated that the Jews had renounced their own self-government, and also passed a law against Jewish usurers.

V. NAPOLEON & JEWS

1. Passing through Strasbourg in 1806, Napoleon was appealed to by City Council to solve problem of Jewish usury, and foreclosure of much land in Alsace by Jews.
2. He decided to convene Assembly of Jewish Notables to ascertain whether Jews could be loyal citizens of France.
3. He propounded 12 questions.
4. In 1807, a Sanhedrin was convened to give religious sanction to the answers.
5. It was not until 1831 that the Parliament accorded equality to Judaism with Christianity, and a rabbi-centered "consistoire" was set up, following model of Catholic church.

VI. TURNING BACK THE CLOCK ON EMANCIPATION

1. Out of frustration and disappointment in the German states, which did not follow the French example, new forms of Judaism began to develop between 1815-1848.
2. First, reform; then neo-orthodox; then conservative. New type of rabbi-educated secular university, not only in Yeshiva. First modern rabbinical seminary in Breslan in 1854.
3. Jews fought in liberal and national movements, but these were not strong enough to win real power.

VII. ACHIEVEMENT OF FULL EMANCIPATION IN EUROPE

Austria	1867
Germany	1869
Italy	1870
England	1845 (except for a seat in Parliament)
	1858 (Lord Rothschild finally seated after the oath "as a Christian" was altered).

"THE JEWISH ENIGMA"

editor, David Englander

Chapter 3 - Jewish Emancipation in 18th and 19th Centuries

ENLIGHTENMENT - 17TH CENTURY

1. Turning point in human ability to understand and control the world.
 - a. Newton's laws of physics opened the physical universe.
 - b. John Locke (philosopher) explained that the mind worked through reason.
2. Religion was challenged.
3. Immanuel Kant stated that mankind was to assume responsibility for itself through the use of intellect and reason.
4. Enlightenment emerged after the terrible wars of religion (1560-1648) and during the relative peace between 1648 and 1789 (French Revolution). *Catholic vs. Protestant*
5. Enlightenment proposed religious peace, toleration, and economic growth, without the heavy destruction of wars - also the growth of states and state absolutism.

ENLIGHTENMENT AND JEWS

1. After 1648, Jews found their way back to Central and Western Europe and England. The rulers wanted help in breaking the nobles, clergy and closed guilds - so Jews were admitted into Germany, France, etc. but did not become equal citizens.
2. Jews were considered morally inferior, because of their relationship to commerce and money. Voltaire and Kant used the Jews as a stick with which to beat on Christianity.
3. In 1781, Joseph II Edict of Toleration granted Protestants and Jews limited religious toleration. But, toleration contained provisions for regeneration (i.e. occupational restructuring, use of vernacular language, changes in social manners, secular education). *autonomous courts, taxes, etc.*
- *4. Emancipation became a contract in which regeneration was exchanged for rights.

MOSES MENDELSON - stunning figure - example of relations with Christians because of his intellect plus social grace.

1. Accepted the contract.
2. Advocated separation of church and state - i.e. Jews to give up their autonomous self-government (schools, courts, social welfare, etc.), except for religion. THIS OPINION ALREADY PRESAGED
NAPOLEONIC SANHEDRIN.

FRENCH REVOLUTION AND EMANCIPATION FOR JEWS

1. Rights of Man - 26 August 1789.
2. Ashkenazim in Alsace - separate from French.
3. Sephardim in Bayonne, Bordeaux - wealthy and acculturated, integrated with French.
4. In a debate, in National Assembly, Count Clermont-Tonnere made famous statement "The Jews should be denied everything as a nation, but granted everything as individuals. They must be citizens."
5. Opponents prevailed - invoking Voltaire - saying the mob would riot.
6. Sephardim separated from Ashkenazim and were quickly granted equality.
7. On 27 September 1791, Ashkenazim gained their rights; and next day the Assembly stipulated that the Jews had renounced their own special autonomy, and also passed a law against Jewish usurers.

NAPOLEON AND THE JEWS

1. Jews gave credit to French peasants to buy lands expropriated from the churches. Collection on these debts caused great tension between Jews and peasants.
2. Napoleon, passing through Strasbourg in 1806, was importuned to solve this problem of Jews and usury. He decided to convene an Assembly of Jewish Notables to ascertain whether Judaism

prevented the Jews from complying with French laws and civic morality. Twelve questions were asked.

3. The answers given showed that the Jews accepted a redefinition of Judaism, and did not preclude social regeneration.
 - a. Judaism was defined as solely a religion.
 - b. The Jews subordinated themselves entirely to the authority of the state; and recognized the superiority of civil over religious law, asserting that rabbis could refuse to give religious sanction to a mixed marriage but were obliged to recognize that it was legally binding in civil law.
 - c. The Jews recognized the equality in Jewish law of their French fellow citizens, and professed their loyalty to the Emperor of France.
4. In 1807, a Sanhedrin of rabbis was convened to give religious sanction to the Notables' answers. Napoleon then recognized Judaism as a consistoire (council) following the model of the French Catholic church. Since this model was a clerical hierarchy, Judaism became a rabbi-centered religion.
5. In 1808, "The Infamous Decrees" were passed which regulated the economic activities and residential rights of the Alsatian Ashkenazim for the next ten years. The Jews felt themselves demoted to second-class citizens.

6. In 1818 the Bourbon Kings did not renew these decrees, and in 1831 the Parliament accorded equality to Judaism with Christianity. Jewish emancipation had been achieved.

TURNING BACK THE CLOCK ON EMANCIPATION

1. What Napoleon demanded of the French Jews (regeneration) and what he gave them in return (equal rights and citizenship) - did not take place in the German states and large cities. There was a reaction backwards after the Congress of Vienna (1815).
2. Out of frustration and dissatisfaction, new forms of Judaism began to develop in the German states between 1815 and 1848. Reform, then neo-orthodox, then the compromise conservative, all began to take form.
3. In addition, there developed the scientific study of Judaism, "Wissenschaft des Judentums", which was intended to make Judaism familiar to non-Jews, thus aiding emancipation. This gave rise to a new type of rabbi - educated in the secular university, not only the yeshiva. David Friedlander (Reform); Samson Raphael Hirsch (neo-orthodox); and Zechariah Frankel (conservative). The latter founded the first modern rabbinical seminary in Breslau in 1854. In turning back the clock on Jewish emancipation, the Congress of Vienna paradoxically advanced the history of Jewish self-understanding and change.

JEWISH INVOLVEMENT IN LIBERAL AND NATIONAL MOVEMENTS

1. The alliance of the Jews with liberalism was firmly cemented . Gabriel Riesser in Germany; Adolphe Cremieux in France; Sir Moses Montefiore in England all fought for Jewish rights.
2. Given their liberal affiliations, Jews were actively engaged in the Revolution of 1848, fighting on the barricades and dying in action. The first funeral turned into a demonstration for the removal of religious distinctions. Five Jews were elected to the German National Parliament; many were elected to state parliaments, also in Austria.
3. But 1848 did not bring real emancipation and equal rights. The liberals were not strong enough to retain power. However, Jewish emancipation had become a principle of liberalism, and the next upheaval would finally establish emancipation.

ACHIEVEMENT OF FULL EMANCIPATION IN EUROPE

1. Liberalism achieved its greatest triumph when it succeeded in establishing unified states based on individual rights. This occurred in the 1860's and 70's.

Austria 1867

Germany 1869

Italy 1870

England 1845 (except for a seat in Parliament)
1858 (Lord Rothschild was finally seated in Parliament
after the oath as a Christian was altered).

