



THE JACOB RADER MARCUS CENTER OF THE
AMERICAN JEWISH ARCHIVES

MS-763: Rabbi Herbert A. Friedman Collection, 1930-2004.

Series I: Wexner Heritage Foundation, 1947-2004.

Subseries 2: Writings and Addresses, 1947-2003.

Box
69

Folder
8

"Dissent and Support." 2 November 1982.

For more information on this collection, please see the finding aid on the
American Jewish Archives website.

DISSENT AND SUPPORT

The Right To Dissent Carries With It The Obligation To Support.

By: RABBI HERBERT A. FRIEDMAN
Given at Friends Clambake Meeting

Eden Roc Hotel, Miami

November 2, 1982

1. THE CREATION AND UPBUILDING OF ISRAEL HAS BEEN ONE OF THE VERY FEW WATERSHED EVENTS IN JEWISH HISTORY. BEFORE IT, WE WERE A DESPISED AND REJECTED PEOPLE. AFTER IT, WE BECAME A LARGER-THAN-LIFE NATION ENJOYING HUGE RESPECT IN THE WORLD. THE FACT OF ISRAEL'S EXISTENCE HAD RADICALLY AND FUNDAMENTALLY ALTERED THE PERCEPTION OF JEWS BY THE NON-JEW AND THE SELF-ESTEEM OF THE JEW HIMSELF. SUBSERVIENCE HAS BEEN REPLACED BY INDEPENDENCE; FEAR HAS GIVEN WAY TO PRIDE; A PRECARIOUS EXISTENCE BASED ON TOLERANCE, SOMETIMES GIVEN GENUINELY BUT MORE OFTEN GRUDGINGLY, HAS BECOME A SECURE EXISTENCE BASED ON AMAZING ACHIEVEMENTS IN ALL FIELDS OF HUMAN ENDEAVOR.
2. FOR HUNDREDS OF YEARS WE LIVED A MEAN, NARROW, INTROVERTED LIFE IN EUROPE. WE SOMETIMES RECALL THE SHTETL WITH NOSTALGIA THROUGH SOME FAVORITE AUTHORS AND PLAYS SUCH AS "FIDDLER ON THE ROOF", BUT THE FACT IS THAT GHETTO LIFE IN RUSSIA AND PLAND WAS REplete WITH GRINDING POVERTY, NARROW HORIZONS, NAUSEATING FEAR OF THE PETTY OFFICIAL AND THE NEXT POGROM.

THERE WAS NO ESCAPE FROM THIS EXISTENCE, SO THE PEOPLE SUFFERED THROUGH IT, ENDLESS CENTURY AFTER CENTURY, LOOKING INWARD TO RELIGION AND DAILY RITUAL, FOR THERE WAS NOTHING OUTSIDE. LIFE IN WESTERN EUROPE WAS HARDLY BETTER, WITH THE CONSTANT PRESSURE OF THE CHURCH FROM EARLY MEDIEVAL TIMES CAUSING MARTYRDOMS, TORTURE, BURNINGS AND AGONY; AND THE EQUALLY CONSTANT PRESSURE OF PETTY DUKES, PRINCELINGS AND LOCAL BARONS REGULATING EVERY ASPECT OF PERSONAL LIFE, SOMETIMES EVICTING, SOMETIMES SQUEEZING MONEY, SOMETIMES TOLERATING FOR BRIEF PERIODS TO OBTAIN SOME SPECIFIC GAIN. ALL OF THIS GAVE LIFE A DREADFUL UNCERTAINTY. HOW THE JEWS KEPT THEIR SANITY AND FAITH IS A GENUINE MIRACLE.

3. AN ESCAPE FROM THIS PRESSURE SLOWLY DAWNED ABOUT TWO HUNDRED YEARS AGO. IN THE NEW WORLD THE AMERICAN REVOLUTION WAS BREATHING NEW SLOGANS OF FREEDOM. IN THE OLD WORLD THE FRENCH REVOLUTION OFFERED LIBERTY AND EQUALITY AT A PRICE. NAPOLEON BROUGHT IT ALL TO A CLIMAX IN 1807 WHEN HE CONVENED A SANHEDRIN, ASKED HIS FAMOUS 12 QUESTIONS, GOT SATISFACTORY ANSWERS - AND OPENED THE DOORS OF FULL EMANCIPATION AND CITIZENSHIP TO THE JEWS, WHO RUSHED HEADLONG INTO THE BRIGHT LIGHT OF FREEDOM AT LAST, EAGERLY AND GLADLY PAYING THE PRICE DEMANDED. WHAT WAS THE PRICE? THE JEWS WERE ASKED TO ASSIMILATE, TO CONSIDER THEMSELVES FRENCHMEN ABOVE ALL ELSE, TO CONSIDER THE FRENCH AS THEIR BROTHERS, TO BE

WILLING TO DIE FOR FRANCE AS THEIR NATION, TO CONSIDER THEMSELVES JEWS BY RELIGION ONLY, THUS GIVING UP THEIR HISTORIC MEMORIES AS AN ANCIENT PEOPLE WITH TIES TO PALESTINE, AND TO PERMIT MIXED MARRIAGES UNDER CIVIL LAW. IN THEIR EAGERNESS TO ESCAPE FROM THE MISERY OF THE PAST THOUSAND YEARS, THE RABBIS AND LAY LEADERS WHO SAT IN THAT SANHEDRIN BOUGHT THE FULL PACKAGE, AND STARTED THE JEWISH PEOPLE DOWN THE SLIPPERY PATH OF ASSIMILATION AS THE PRICE FOR EQUALITY.

4. AFTER A HUNDRED YEARS OF TRYING TO LIVE LIKE A JEW INSIDE HIS OWN HOUSE, AND LIKE A FRENCHMAN, ENGLISHMAN, GERMAN, AMERICAN OUTSIDE ON THE STREET - THE JEWISH COLLECTIVELY BEGAN TO REALIZE THAT THE PRICE FOR FREEDOM MAY HAVE BEEN TOO HIGH IF IT WERE TO RESULT IN THE WEAKENING OF JEWISH LOYALTY, KNOWLEDGE AND SURVIVAL INSTINCT. IT BECAME CLEAR THAT THERE MUST BE A REVERSION TO THE PRINCIPLES OF JEWISH NATIONAL EXISTENCE, IF POSSIBLE WITHOUT LOSING THE WONDERFUL ADVANTAGES OF THE OTHER NATIONAL EXISTENCES IN WHICH JEWS WERE BEGINNING TO PARTICIPATE FULLY. AHAD HA-AM CALLED FOR THE CREATION OF A SPIRITUAL CENTER IN PALESTINE TO REJUVENATE THE HEBREW LANGUAGE AND THE HEBREW PROPHETIC SPIRIT; THEODORE HERZL CALLED FOR A POLITICAL CHARTER TO BE GRANTED BY THE SULTAN FOR A JEWISH REBUILDING IN THE ANCIENT LAND NOW PART OF THE TURKISH EMPIRE; CHAIM WEIZMANN CALLED FOR THE PRACTICAL ZIONIST WORK OF BUILDING ONE SETTLEMENT AT A TIME TO REPOPULATE THE COUNTRY. ALL OF THIS WAS INENDED TO REVERSE THE SWING OF THE ASSIMILATIONIST

PENDULUM, AND TO ACHIEVE THE MOST RADICAL OF ALL GOALS - FOR JEWS TO BE FREE IN THEIR OWN LAND, NOT ONLY TO BE GIVEN EQUAL RIGHTS IN EVERY OTHER LAND ON EARTH.

5. AFTER HALF A CENTURY OF PREPARATORY WORK, THE MIRACLE OF STATEHOOD OCCURRED THROUGH A COMBINATION OF VERY HARD POLITICAL LOBBYING AND A VERY COSTLY WAR OF INDEPENDENCE. SOME SAY THE HOLOCAUST WHICH ENDED IN 1945 PRODUCED THE U.N. PARTITION RESOLUTION OF 1947. OTHERS SAY IT IS A TRIVIALIZATION OF THE MONUMENTAL SLAUGHTER TO LINK THE HOLOCAUST WITH THE CREATION OF THE STATE. TO DISCUSS THIS IN DEPTH WOULD TAKE US ON A LONG DIGRESSION. ONE THING IS CLEAR - THE STATE WAS BORN IN BLOOD - THE BLOOD OF ONE PERSON OUT OF EVERY HUNDRED WHO LIVED IN ISRAEL IN 1948, AND I BELIEVE THE BLOOD OF ONE JEW OUT OF EVERY THREE IN THE ENTIRE WORLD WHO HAD DIED IN THE HITLER PERIOD.

6. THE GLORIOUS REBIRTH INFUSED THE ENTIRE JEWISH PEOPLE WITH A NEW ZEST FOR LIFE, A NEW SPIRIT, A NEW ADVENTURE, A NEW DEFINITION OF SELF. WE WERE ANGRY AT WHAT THE WORLD HAD DONE TO US, SO WE ATTACKED THE SOIL AND VENTILATED ANGER ON THE ROCKS AND MADE THINGS GROW AND CHANGED THE THE COLOR FROM BROWN DESERT TO BLUE IRRIGATION DITCHES AND GREEN FIELDS. WE WERE ANGRY THAT THE SURROUNDING NEIGHBORS HAD TRIED TO STRANGLE US AT BIRTH, SO WE FASHIONED WEAPONS AND LEARNED HOW TO USE THEM, AND FOUGHT OFF THE ASSAULT OF WAR AFTER WAR. TODAY, ISRAEL IS

THE FOURTH STRONGEST MILITARY POWER ON EARTH, AFTER RUSSIA, AMERICA AND CHINA. IMAGINE THAT. WE WERE ANGRY THAT THERE WERE JEWS IN OTHER COUNTRIES UNSAFE AND ILL AT EASE, SO WE THREW OUR DOORS OPEN, ERECTED TENTS FOR NEWCOMERS AND EVENTUALLY HOUSES, SCHOOLS AND HOSPITALS, FARMS AND FACTORIES. A THIRD OF A CENTURY, SUCH A SHORT TIME, HAS SEEN THE MOST INCREDIBLE NATION-BUILDING TO TAKE PLACE ANYWHERE ON THIS PLANET. SUCH A MIXTURE OF BRAINS AND MONEY, ANGER AND PRIDE, VISION AND PRACTICALITY - ALL POURED IN FAST - WITH AN EXPLOSIVE POWER HITHERTO UNFELT IN A PEOPLE ESSENTIALLY ASLEEP FOR A THOUSAND YEARS AND GROPING FOR THE LAST HUNDRED YEARS - HAS RESULTED IN THE MODERN PHENOMENON CALLED ISRAEL - A PEOPLE'S ASSERTION OF ITS OWN FUTURE DIRECTION AND ITS POTENTIAL CONTRIBUTION TO OTHER PEOPLES IN AFRICA AND ASIA ALSO YEARNING TO CREATE.

7. AND YES, IN SOME DIM AND NOT YET FULLY ARTICULATED MANNER, WE EVEN SEE THAT REBORN ISRAEL MAY BE THE ANSWER TO THE DILEMMA OF THE ASSIMILATION WHICH STILL PLAGUES THE WESTERN JEW LIVING IN FREEDOM IN THE LANDS OF THE DIASPORA WHERE HE HAS SUCCESSFULLY PROGRESSED AND ADJUSTED. ISRAEL THROUGH THE FUTURE EFFECTS OF CREATING A NEW UNIVERSAL LANGUAGE HEBREW; THROUGH ITS UNIVERSITIES WHICH CAN ABSORB THOUSANDS OF DIASPORA STUDENTS; THROUGH ITS TEACHING OF JUDAISM IN HUNDREDS OF INSTITUTES; THROUGH ITS NETWORK OF LINKS AND CONNECTIONS BETWEEN MILLIONS OF JEWS INSIDE AND OUTSIDE, WILL HOPEFULLY RESTORE FOR JEWS

THAT BALANCE BETWEEN LIVING A LOYAL AND MEANINGFUL JEWISH LIFE IN THE DIASPORA, AS WELL AS A SINCERE PATRIOTIC EXISTENCE IN THEIR VARIOUS NATIONS OF RESIDENCE.

8. BECAUSE THE SIGNIFICANCE OF ISRAEL TO ALMOST EVERY JEW IS SO DEEP, AND BECAUSE THE ACHIEVEMENTS OF MODERN ISRAEL HAVE BEEN SO BREATHTAKING, AND BECAUSE THE BRIGHT STAR IS SO ATTRACTIVE, JEWS ALL OVER THE WORLD HAVE SUPPORTED ISRAEL WITH ZEST AND VIGOR, WITH MONEY AND MORALE, WITH POLITICAL, SOCIAL, TECHNICAL HELP - HAVE DONE SO WITH GREAT ENTHUSIASM AND CONSTANT EFFORT, ENJOYING EVERY MINUTE OF IT.

9. SUDDENLY, FOR THE FIRST TIME, SOMETHING HAPPENED WHICH CAUSED A BREAK IN THAT STEADY FLOW OF INTELLECTUAL AND MORAL SUPPORT DISSATISFACTION WITH ISRAELI POLICIES BEGAN TO BE FELT A FEW YEARS AGO, WHEN THE PRIME MINISTER MADE MANIFEST WHAT HE MEANT BY AUTONOMY IN THE WEST BANK, WHICH HE CALLED BY THE BIBLICAL NAMES OF JUDEA AND SAMARIA. THE VERY USE OF THESE NAMES EXPRESSED CLEARLY HIS CONCEPT THAT THEY WERE AN INTEGRAL PART OF MODERN ISRAEL BECAUSE THEY HAD ONCE BEEN PART OF THE BIBLICAL KINGDOMS OF DAVID AND SOLOMON. THIS WAS CONSISTENT WITH HIS ATTITUDE TOWARD ESTABLISHING SETTLEMENTS IN THE WEST BANK, WHICH FACT CAUSED SEVERE IRRITATIONS WITH THE UNITED STATES AND WESTERN EUROPE, BECAUSE IT APPEARED TO BE A POLICY OF CREEPING ANNEXATION IN

DIRECT CONFLICT WITH ISRAEL'S STATED WILLINGNESS TO GRANT THE ARABS IN THE WEST BANK THEIR AUTONOMY. THE CONTRADICTION HERE CAUSED MANY CRITICS TO SAY THAT THE PRIME MINISTER WHO SET THE TONE, THE AGRICULTURE MINISTER (ARIEL SHARON) WHO CARRIED OUT THE SETTLEMENT POLICY, AND THE MAJORITY OF THE RIGHT-WING PLUS RELIGIOUS-PARTIES-CABINET WHICH APPROVED THESE ACTIONS WERE ALL IN A CONSPIRACY TO VIOLATE THE SPIRIT OF THE CAMP DAVID ACCORDS WHILE AT THE SAME TIME PAYING LIP-SERVICE TO THEIR SANCTITY. TO MANY DIASPORA JEWS AND ISRAELIS ALIKE, THIS SEEMED HYPOCRITICAL, SLEAZY, DISHONEST AND PROVOCATIVE. DISCONTENT AND UNEASINESS BEGAN TO BE FELT, IN MEASURABLE QUANTITY AND QUALITY FOR THE FIRST TIME, AMONG FRIENDS AND SUPPORTERS.

10. OF COURSE, THERE WERE LARGE NUMBERS, BOTH INSIDE AND OUTSIDE ISRAEL WHO SUPPORTED THESE POLICIES. A LEGITIMATE MAJORITY OF THE ISRAELI ELECTORATE VOTED FOR THE PRIME MINISTER AND HIS COALITION. A LARGE PORTION OF DIASPORA JEWRY AGREED WITH THE THRUST AND DIRECTION, FEELING THAT THE IRRITATIONS AND DISAGREEMENTS WITH THE UNITED STATES WERE NEITHER CRITICAL NOR EVEN SERIOUS. ONE HEARD THE STATEMENT FROM BOTH AMERICAN AND ISRAELI OFFICIALS THAT TRUE ALLIES OFTEN DISAGREED ON SPECIFIC ISSUES BUT THE FUNDAMENTAL RELATIONSHIP OF MUTUAL RESPECT AND INTER-DEPENDENCE WAS NOT IN JEOPARDY.

11. MATTERS CONTINUED THIS WAY FOR SEVERAL YEARS - MUTTERINGS OF PROTEST

AND MURMURINGS OF SUPPORT - UNTILL THE LEBANESE WAR THIS PAST SUMMER, CULMINATING IN THE SHATILA-SABRA CAMP MASSACRE IN WEST BEIRUT ON THURSDAY THROUGH SATURDAY, SEPTEMBER 16 - 18, ROSH HASHONAH OF ALL DAYS. THEN JEWISH PROTEST EXPLODED. IT WOULD NOT BE CONTAINED. THE DEEPEST CURRENTS OF THAT WONDERFULLY SENSITIVE JEWISH CONSCIENCE HAD BEEN STIRRED AND EVEN THOUGH NOT A SINGLE ISRAELI SOLDIER HAD BEEN PERSONALLY INVOLVED IN THE MASSACRE INSIDE THE CAMPS, A HOWL OF PROTEST AROSE FROM A JEWISH PUBLIC ALL OVER THE WORLD, WHICH QUICKLY FORCED THE PRIME MINISTER TO RETREAT AND TO CALL FOR AN OFFICIAL COURT OF INQUIRY WHICH HAS ALREADY BEGUN ITS HEARINGS. SO THE MATTER IS SUB-JUDICE AND THEREFORE I WILL LEAVE IT. WE SHALL HAVE ITS FINDINGS WITHIN TWO MONTHS.

12. THE SUBJECT FOR US TO ANALYZE MOST DEEPLY IS THIS QUESTION OF DISSENT. THE KEY ISSUE TO HAVE SURFACED IN THE RECENT PAST IS THE RIGHT OF THE JEWS WHO LIVE IN THE DIASPORA TO EXPRESS DISAGREEMENT, PRIVATELY OR PUBLICLY, WITH ANNOUNCED POLICIES OF A DEMOCRATICALLY-ELECTED GOVERNMENT IN ISRAEL. THE LINES OF THE ARGUMENT ARE VERY CLEAR. ONE POSITION IS THAT ONLY THOSE WHO LIVE IN ISRAEL, VOTE IN ITS ELECTIONS, PAY TAXES, SHED BLOOD IN ITS WARS HAVE THE RIGHT TO AN OPINION. THAT POSITION IS HELD BY MOST JEWS OF THE DIASPORA, AND MOST OF ISRAEL'S HIGHEST OFFICIALS. BECAUSE THAT IS THE POSITION OF THE LARGE MAJORITY, IT HAS PREVAILED FOR SO LONG. THE OPPOSITE POSITION IS THAT ALL JEWS

IN THE WORLD WHO FEEL THE GREAT SURGES OF LOVE FOR AND PRIDE IN ISRAEL WHICH HAVE PRODUCED THEIR SUPPORT IN EVERY FORM HAVE THE RIGHT, NAY, THE DUTY, TO EXPRESS AN OPINION. FAILURE TO DO SO REPRESENTS DEFAULT, AND WILL CAUSE EROSION OF THE SLOGAN "WE ARE ONE". WE ARE NOT ONE, IF THE DIASPORA PORTION OF THE JEWISH PEOPLE IS FORCED TO BE SILENT. SILENCE LENDS AGREEMENT. THAT IS THE MEANING OF THE WORD ACQUIESCENCE. IF ISRAEL BELONGS ONLY TO THE JEWS WHO LIVE THERE AND ALL OTHERS MUST ACQUIESCE, THEN THE SPLITTING OF THE JEWISH PEOPLE WILL BE THE INEVITABLE AND TRAGIC OUTCOME OF THE WHOLE ZIONIST EFFORT OF THE PAST CENTURY. HOW IRONIC IT WOULD BE IF THE STRUGGLE TO BUILD A HOMELAND FOR THE PHYSICAL AND SPIRITUAL SECURITY OF THE WHOLE JEWISH PEOPLE WERE TO RESULT IN A SEPARATION OF ISRAEL'S JEWS FROM DIASPORA JEWS. IF BOTH PARTS SEPARATED AND WENT THEIR INDIVIDUAL HISTORIC WAYS, WHO KNOWS WHERE, WHEN OR HOW THEY WOULD EVER BE REJOINED. THE GHOSTLY LAUGHTER OF OUR ENEMIES MIGHT BE HEARD COMING FROM CENTURIES AHEAD.

13. ISRAELI OFFICIALS, WHETHER IN THE GOVERNMENT OR THE JEWISH AGENCY OR THE ARMY OR ANY MAJOR INSTITUTION OR NEWSPAPER OR PUBLIC BODY, WHO SAY THAT DIASPORA JEWS SHOULD NOT TAKE PART IN EXPRESSING OPINIONS OR TRYING TO INFLUENCE POLICY ON INTERNAL AFFAIRS, AND WHO RATIONALIZE THAT ATTITUDE BY THE CONVENTIONAL WISDOM THAT JEWS WHO STAY OUTSIDE THROUGH FREE CHOICE CANNOT, AT THE SAME TIME, ACT AS INSIDERS, HAVE DECIDED THAT UNITY IS A MYTH AND THEY ARE WILLING FRANKLY TO SAY

THAT THERE ARE TWO DISTINCT CATEGORIES OF JEWS WHO, LIKE REMOTE COUSINS, FIND THAT THEY REALLY DO NOT HAVE MUCH TO SAY TO EACH OTHER WHEN THEY MEET INFREQUENTLY ON SOME FAMILY OCCASION.

WOE TO THOSE OFFICIALS WHO MAKE SUCH A DECISION, FOR THEY ARE DOOMING THE FUTURE OF ISRAEL, OR AT LEAST RELEGATING IT TO SOME BALKAN EXISTENCE. ISRAELI OFFICIALS WHO TAKE SUCH A POSITION, NO MATTER HOW HIGHLY PLACED THEY MAY BE, ARE BLIND IN THEIR CHAUVINISM, MYOPIC IN THEIR NARROW NATIONALISM, AND ARROGANT IN THEIR JUDGEMENT. NO MATTER HOW FRUSTRATED THEY MAY BE BY THE FAILURE OF WESTERN AND RUSSIAN JEWS TO MIGRATE TO ISRAEL IN LARGE NUMBERS; NO MATTER HOW ANNOYED THEY MAY BE AT THE UNFAIRNESS OF THE SHARE OF THE DEFENSE AND ECONOMIC BURDEN THEY MUST CARRY COMPARED TO THE DIASPORA SEGMENT; NO MATTER HOW WEARY OR HEARTSICK THEY MAY BE AT THE DIFFICULTY OF THE STRUGGLE TO GROW AND PROGRESS; NO MATTER THE LEGITIMACY OF ALL THESE AND MANY MORE EMOTIONS THEY MAY FEEL - THERE IS NO EXCUSE FOR LEADERS IN ISRAEL TODAY TO HAVE LOST THEIR SENSE OF HISTORY, WHICH SHOULD TELL THEM THAT A DIVIDED KINGDOM IS WEAK AND DOES NOT ENDURE WHILE A UNITED KINGDOM PRODUCES GLORY AND CREATIVITY. NO -WHEN ISRAELI JEWS DISPLAY A TURNING INWARD AND A DENIAL OF EQUALITY, DIASPORA JEWS MUST SPEAK OUT BLUNTLY AND STRONGLY THAT THIS IS NOT THE WAY TO THE UNITED FUTURE, BUT WILL LEAD TO IRREVOCABLE FRAGMENTATION.

14. BUT THE PROBLEM WITH DIASPORA JEWS IS THAT THEY DO NOT SPEAK OUT BLUNTLY AND STRONGLY, AT LEAST NOT UNTIL VERY RECENTLY. IF THE ERROR IN THE ISRAELI ATTITUDE IS ONE OF TENDING TOWARD ARROGANCE, THE ERROR IN THE DIASPORA ATTITUDE IS ONE OF TENDING TOWARD SUBSERVIENCE. THE DIASPORA JEW "COPS OUT" IN THE VERNACULAR, BY HIMSELF SHRINKING BEHIND THE SAME CLICHES. THE DIASPORA JEW SAYS - I DON'T SERVE IN THE ARMY, SO WHAT RIGHT HAVE I TO SAY WHETHER ISRAEL SHOULD OR SHOULD NOT GO INTO WEST BEIRUT. HE SAYS - I DON'T VOTE AND ELECT A GOVERNMENT, SO WHAT RIGHT HAVE I TO SAY WHAT ISRAEL'S FOREIGN POLICY SHOULD BE TOWARD AMERICA OR CHINA OR ANY PLACE ELSE. HE SAYS - I DON'T LIVE OR SPEAK THE LANGUAGE OR KNOW THE INNER DETAILS OF DAILY LIFE, SO WHAT RIGHT HAVE I TO EXPRESS OPINIONS OR TRY TO SHAPE SOCIAL OR ECONOMIC OR ETHNIC OR EDUCATIONAL MATTERS. ALL OF THIS COYNESS AND WITHDRAWAL AND SELF-IMPOSED RETICENCE ON THE PART OF THE DIASPORA JEW IS THE MIRROR IMAGE OF THE CHAUVINISM OF THE ISRAELI JEW AND IS EQUALLY WRONG. IF THE DIASPORA JEWS CONTINUE FOR LONG ALONG THE LINES OF KEEPING SILENT AND WITHDRAWING, THEY WILL BE JUST AS GUILTY AS THEIR ISRAELI COUNTERPARTS OF SPLITTING THE JEWISH NATION.

DIASPORA JEWS MUST OVERCOME THEIR SHYNESS: ISRAELI JEWS MUST WELCOME THEIR PARTICIPATION: AND THE PRICE OF THIS CLOSENESS WILL BE CONFLICT, WHICH WOULD BE WONDERFUL, FOR OUT OF SUCH FRICTION WILL COME PROGRESS AND GROWTH.

15. TWO QUESTIONS OF LIMIT MUST BE CONSIDERED. WHAT TYPE OF DIASPORA JEW HAS THE

RIGHT TO TAKE PART DEEPLY, SERIOUSLY, PROVOCATIVELY IN ISRAEL'S INTERNAL AFFAIRS;
AND IN WHAT MANNER SHOULD HE/SHE TAKE PART? THE ANSWERS DICTATED BY COMMON SENSE
ARE THE MOST USEFUL. THE DIASPORA JEW WHO CARES DEEPLY, FEELS DEEPLY, BELIEVES DEEPLY
IN THE CENTRALITY AND IMPORTANCE OF ISRAEL IS OBVIOUSLY THE ONE WHO WILL BE MOST UPSET
WHEN SOMETHING SEEMS WRONG TO HIM AND HE IS EXACTLY THE ONE WHO HAS EVERY RIGHT TO
ARGUE, FIGHT, DISAGREE, SPEAK OUT, SEEK TO MAKE HIS OPINION FELT. HE HAS A RIGHT BE-
CAUSE HE CARES. FURTHER, HIS CONDUCT MUST DEMONSTRATE THAT HE CARES. HIS FINANCIAL
SUPPORT; HIS POLITICAL ACTION VIS-A-VIS THE GOVERNMENT WHOSE CITIZEN HE IS; HIS MORAL
INFLUENCE ON OTHER JEWS AND ALSO NON-JEWS; HIS FREQUENT VISITS TO ISRAEL; HIS CHILDREN
STUDYING THERE - ALL THESE AND MANY OTHER SPECIFIC DEEDS ARE THE CREDENTIALS HE OFFERS
THAT HIS CARING IS NOT MERELY INTELLECTUAL OR EMOTIONAL BUT IS ALSO PRACTICAL. HE HAS
EARNED HIS STRIPES AND THUS HIS RIGHTS.

I KNOW THERE ARE THOSE WHO WOULD CLAIM THAT SUCH "PROOFS OF LOYALTY" ARE NOT
NECESSARY AND EVERY JEW, BY VIRTUE OF BIRTH, IS ENTITLED TO THE INNER PARTICIPATION WE
ARE DISCUSSING. BUT I WOULD PREFER TO BE STRICTER IN ORDER TO STRENGTHEN THE CASE.
MY STRICTNESS LIMITS THE CATEGORY, FOR I WISH THE PROCESS OF MUTUALITY AND DIALOGUE
REALLY TO START, NOT ON THE POLITE LEVEL OF SOME PRE-ARRANGED SEMINAR ONCE A YEAR,
BUT ON THE DAILY LEVEL OF LIFE'S BATTLEFIELD. SO, LET US START AT LEAST WITH THOSE
WHOSE CREDENTIALS ARE INDISPUTABLE. LATER, WE CAN RELAX THE CRITERIA.

16. THE HARDER QUESTION CONCERNS THE MANNER OF DISSENT - SHOULD IT BE PUBLIC OR ONLY PRIVATE? HERE THE ARGUMENT RAGES HOTLY. THOSE WHO FEEL PASSIONATELY SAY THAT ONCE THE RIGHT TO DISSENT IS ESTABLISHED, IT IS SHAMEFUL AND IGNOBLE NOT TO BE ABLE TO EXPRESS IT ON OP-ED PAGES, IN OPEN TV INTERVIEWS AND AT STUDENT ASSEMBLIES IN UNIVERSITIES. TO GRANT ONESSELF THE RIGHT TO SPEAK OUT, BUT THEN TO CONFINE ONESSELF TO INTERNAL JEWISH AUDIENCES OR AT MOST TO STRICTLY JEWISH PUBLICATIONS IS THE HEIGHT OF SELF-GHETTOIZATION. LOGIC GIVES CREDENCE TO THIS POINT OF VIEW. THERE IS NO SUCH THING AS BEING A LITTLE PREGNANT. ONCE AN INDIVIDUAL OR AN ORGANIZATION CONCLUDES THAT HE SERVES HIS OWN CONSCIENCE AND THE GENERAL CAUSE OF JUDAISM AND ISRAEL BETTER BY CRITICIZING AND OFFERING SUGGESTIONS AND DEMANDING CHANGES, THEN IT FOLLOWS THAT THE MORE WIDELY HE SPREADS HIS VIEWS AND SEEKS TO PERSUADE OTHERS OF THEIR VALIDITY, THE MORE IS HE SERVING THE RIGHT AS HE SEES IT. IT SEEMS FOOLISH AND FRUSTRATING TO CONCEDE TO HIM THE RIGHT TO SPEAK, BUT TO INSIST THAT HE DO SO IN THE PRIVACY OF HIS OWN CIRCLES.

THOSE WHO INSIST UPON THE PRIVATE APPROACH USE AS THEIR STRONGEST ARGUMENT THE FACT THAT PUBLIC ATTACK BY DIASPORA JEWS AGAINST SOME POLICY OR PERSONALITY OF ISRAEL GIVES AID AND COMFORT TO ISRAEL'S ENEMIES, EITHER IN THE ARAB WORLD, THE THIRD WORLD, OR EVEN THE WASHINGTON WORLD. IF A JEW SAYS SOMETHING PUBLICLY IN DIS-AGREEMENT WITH ISRAEL, IT IS ARGUED THAT THIS IMMEDIATELY PLACES AMMUNITION IN THE

HANDS OF AN ENEMY. A SOLID FRONT MUST BE MAINTAINED AT ALL COSTS, SO SAY THE DEFENDERS OF SILENCE. AND THE ARGUMENT IS POWERFUL, FOR NO ONE WHO CARES ENOUGH ABOUT ISRAEL TO BECOME EMBROILED IN THIS WHOLE CONTROVERSY, WANTS TO HAVE IT ON HIS CONSCIENCE THAT HE MAY HAVE DONE OR SAID SOMETHING WHICH COULD BE EXPLOITED TO HURT ISRAEL. THE STRENGTH OF THIS ARGUMENT HAS BEEN OVERWHELMING UP TO NOW.

BUT A FEW BRAVE SOULS HAVE WRITTEN TO THE NEW YORK TIMES, GIVEN PUBLIC INTERVIEWS TO THE JERUSALEM POST, MADE SPEECHES WHICH WERE QUOTED IN THE GENERAL MEDIA, AND ISRAEL HAS NOT COLLAPSED. THE ENEMY HAS FOUND LITTLE UPON WHICH TO SEIZE. INTELLIGENT AND CIVILIZED MEN AND WOMEN THE WORLD OVER UNDERSTAND PERFECTLY WELL THAT JEWISH OPINION IS NOT MONOLITHIC - AND, AS A MATTER OF FACT, IT IS AN INSULT TO INTELLIGENCE TO TRY TO GIVE THE IMPRESSION THAT THE ENTIRE JEWISH PEOPLE REACTS AUTOMATICALLY WITH ONE RESPONSE TO EVERY ISRAELI STIMULUS. WE ARE A VIBRANT PEOPLE WITH VARIEGATED OPINIONS AND STUBBORN STREAKS. ALL - EVEN OUR ENEMIES - KNOW THIS ABOUT US. TO PRETEND THAT WE ALL MARCH TO ONE DRUM IS ABSURD. ONE OF THE ATTRACTIVE ASPECTS OF OUR COLLECTIVE PERSONA IS THE ARGUMENTATIVE NATURE OF OUR INTELLECT.

NO - IT IS BECOMING EVER CLEARER THAT DISSENT WILL INEVITABLY TAKE A MORE AND MORE PUBLIC FORM - AND I THINK THIS IS PROPER, SO LONG AS THE BOUNDS OF CLEAR THINKING, RATIONAL DISCUSSION, NOT OVER-HEATED EMOTION, GOOD TASTE, ALL PREVAIL; AND FURTHER, THAT ALL DISSENT BE TEMPERED WITH CONTINUOUS REPEATED STATEMENTS OF OUR BASIC LOVE, IDENTIFICATION AND SUPPORT FOR THE VERY ISRAEL WE MAY BE CRITICIZING AT THE MOMENT FOR SOME PARTICULAR REASON.

17. LET ME CONCLUDE WITH THE FINAL POINT TO WHICH LOGIC DRAWS US -- NAMELY THE DUTY TO DISSENT. IT IS NOT ONLY A MATTER OF RIGHT, IT IS A MATTER OF OBLIGATION. ALL OF US WHO WORK SO HARD FOR THE COUNTRY ARE MOTIVATED BY THE DESIRE TO SEE HER GROW AND IMPROVE AND SUCCEED -- SO WE GIVE OUR EFFORT AND ENERGY AND MONEY. BUT WE MUST ALSO GIVE OUR SUGGESTIONS AND OPINIONS AND THOUGHTS AND ATTITUDES. IT IS OUR DUTY TO CONTRIBUTE THESE PRECIOUS INTANGIBLE ASSETS. SHOULD WE BE MERELY RUBBER-STAMPS? THIS WILL NOT SUSTAIN OUR ENTHUSIASM. SHOULD WE BE PARTNERS IN SHALLOW SLOGANS ONLY? THIS WILL LEAD TO BOREDOM AND DISINTEREST. TRUE, LASTING, SINCERE INVOLVEMENT CAN BE SUSTAINED FOR A PERSON'S LIFETIME ONLY IF THERE IS A LIVING AND ORGANIC RELATIONSHIP. WE HAVE A DUTY TO PARTICIPATE IN THE INTERNAL QUARRELS,

FOR WHAT FAMILY IS WITHOUT THEM? A PERSON WHO SEPARATES FROM THE CONTROVERSIES RAGING AROUND THE TABLE IS A STRANGER, NOT A MEMBER OF THAT FAMILY. YOUR DUTY IS TO ENTER INTO THE DEEPEST DEPTHS OF THE ARGUMENT, AND WHEN IT IS OVER YOU HAVE CONTRIBUTED YOUR PASSION, YOUR PERSONALITY, EVERYTHING YOU HAVE. THE DECISION IS THEN YOURS AS WELL, AND THEREAFTER YOU WILL FEEL BOUND TO HELP CARRY IT OUT.

MR. EBAN IS OPPOSED TO MR. BEGIN'S POLICY OF ESTABLISHING SETTLEMENTS IN THE WEST BANK. HE DECIDED TO GO PUBLIC WITH HIS OPPOSITION AND HAS BEEN ATTACKING THE POLICY FIERCELY. HE BELIEVES THIS POLICY WILL LEAD TO A LOSS OF ISRAEL'S JEWISH AND DEMOCRATIC CHARACTER. HE BELIEVES IT WILL LEAD TO ISRAEL'S ISOLATION AND CAUSE ISRAEL TO BE GUILTY OF VIOLATING HER INTERNATIONAL OBLIGATIONS. SO HE FIGHTS THE POLICY.

IN EXPLANATION OF HIS DECISION TO GO PUBLIC, HE RECENTLY WROTE: "THERE IS NO HIGHER PATRIOTISM THAT THAT INVOLVED IN THE STRUGGLE TO RESTORE THE IMAGE OF A JEWISH DEMOCRATIC STATE SEEKING TO BRING ITS INTERESTS INTO A DEGREE OF HARMONY WITH THE INTEREST OF OTHERS."

PROFESSOR JACOB NEUSNER OF BROWN UNIVERSITY SUMMED IT UP IN A

RECENT ARTICLE. "I OPPOSED THE SIX-DAY WAR, DECLARING IT NEEDLESS. WITH MY WONDERFUL MAZEL, MY LETTER TO THE NEW YORK TIMES APPEARED THE DAY BEFORE THE WAR BROKE OUT. I HAVE ALWAYS OPPOSED THE SETTLEMENTS IN THE WEST BANK, AND MY LETTER ON THE OP-ED PAGE OF THE TIMES APPEARED JUST BEFORE THE YOM KIPPUR WAR. I WROTE IN ZIONIST MAGAZINES IN THE LATE 60'S THAT WE MUST MAKE AN ACCOMODATION TO THE ARABS ON JERUSALEM AND THIS WAS A SMALL PRICE FOR PEACE.

WHEN THE LEBANESE WAR BROKE OUT LAST JUNE, I DOUBLED MY CONTRIBUTION TO THE JEWISH FEDERATION OF RHODE ISLAND. IT WAS NOT TO HELP PAY FOR THE WAR OR EVEN TO SIGNIFY APPROVAL. IT WAS BECAUSE I BELIEVED IN ISRAEL.

IT DOES NOT MEAN I MUST APPROVE EVERYTHING THE STATE OF ISRAEL DOES OR SUPPORT TO THE LAST DETAIL THE LEAST POSITION OF THE CURRENT ELECTED OFFICIAL IN THE STATE. IT DOES MEAN THAT I MUST OPPOSE THE THINGS I THINK ARE WRONG AND SUPPORT THE THINGS I THINK ARE RIGHT.

WHATEVER THE ISRAELIS DO, MY CONCERN IS UNCONDITIONAL. BECAUSE I CARED, I CRITICIZED. BECAUSE I SHALL ALWAYS CARE, I SHALL GIVE MORE TODAY THAN EVER IN THE PAST, TO SHOW THAT LOVE IS UNCONDITIONAL, THAT COMMITMENT, CONCERN AND CARING COUNT MOST WHEN MOST TESTED."

TO ME, THAT IS THE HEALTHIEST ATTITUDE OF ALL. DO BOTH. CRITICIZE AND SUPPORT; DISSENT AND ENCOURAGE; DISAGREE AND COMMIT. DON'T BE SILENT, DON'T "COP OUT", DON'T FEEL INHIBITED -- SAY WHAT YOU FEEL WITHOUT ANY SENSE OF DISLOYALTY. IT'S YOUR ISRAEL TOO, EVEN THOUGH YOU REMAIN IN THE DIASPORA. BUT ALWAYS REMEMBER THAT IF IT IS YOUR ISRAEL TOO, THEN IT NEEDS YOUR LOVING CARE, YOUR DEEPEST CONCERN, YOUR STEADFAST AND ETERNAL BACKING.

ACT IN THIS MANNER AND YOU WILL INFLUENCE POLICIES, CORRECT IMBALANCES, ADD AN INTERNATIONAL PERSPECTIVE -- ALL OF WHICH WILL MAKE ISRAEL MOVE MORE STEADILY TOWARD THAT WONDERFUL CONDITION WE WISH FOR HER -- TO BE SAFE AND SECURE, A GENUINE DEMOCRACY, SOCIALLY AND ECONOMICALLY HEALTHY, GIVING HAPPINESS TO HER CITIZENS, GIVING PRIDE AND SELF-RESPECT TO ALL OTHER JEWS IN THE WORLD, AND PROVIDING THAT

LIGHT TO THE NATIONS WHICH IS THE ETERNAL DREAM AND MISSION OF THE
SINCE THE DAYS OF THE BIBLE. ALL THIS CAN AND WILL BE ACHIEVED.

בני ישראל



DISSENT and SUPPORT

THE RIGHT TO DISSENT CARRIES WITH IT THE OBLIGATION TO SUPPORT

*Speech Given at Friends Clambake Meeting
Eden Roc Hotel, Miami
November 2, 1952*

1. THE CREATION AND UPBUILDING OF ISRAEL HAS BEEN ONE OF THE VERY FEW WATERSHED EVENTS IN JEWISH HISTORY. BEFORE IT WE WERE A DESPISED AND REJECTED PEOPLE. AFTER IT, WE BECAME A LARGER-THAN-LIFE NATION ENJOYING HUGE RESPECT IN THE WORLD. THE FACT OF ISRAEL'S EXISTENCE HAS RADICALLY AND FUNDAMENTALLY ALTERED THE PERCEPTION OF JEWS BY THE NON-JEW AND THE SELF-ESTEEM OF THE JEW HIMSELF. SUBSERVIENCE HAS BEEN REPLACED BY INDEPENDENCE; FEAR HAS GIVEN WAY TO PRIDE; A PRECARIOUS EXISTENCE BASED ON TOLERANCE, SOMETIMES GIVEN GENUINELY BUT MORE OFTEN GRUDGINGLY, HAS BECOME A SECURE EXISTENCE BASED ON AMAZING ACHIEVEMENTS IN ALL FIELDS OF HUMAN ENDEAVOR.
2. FOR HUNDREDS OF YEARS WE LIVED A MEAN, NARROW, INTROVERTED LIFE IN EUROPE. ^{SOMETIMES} WE RECALL THE SHTETL WITH NOSTALGIA THROUGH SOME FAVORITE ^{SUCH AS "FIDDLER ON THE ROOF"} AUTHORS AND PLAYS, BUT THE FACT IS THAT GHETTO LIFE IN RUSSIA AND POLAND WAS REplete WITH GRINDING POVERTY, NARROW HORIZONS, NAUSEATING FEAR OF THE PETTY OFFICIAL AND THE NEXT POGROM. THERE WAS NO ESCAPE FROM THIS EXISTENCE, SO THE PEOPLE SUFFERED THROUGH IT, ENDLESS CENTURY AFTER CENTURY, LOOKING INWARD TO RELIGION AND DAILY RITUAL, FOR THERE WAS NOTHING OUTSIDE. LIFE IN WESTERN EUROPE WAS HARDLY BETTER, WITH THE

CONSTANT PRESSURE OF THE CHURCH FROM EARLY MEDIEVAL TIMES CAUSING MARTYRDOMS, TORTURE, BURNINGS AND AGONY; AND THE EQUALLY CONSTANT PRESSURE OF PETTY DUKES, PRINCELINGS AND LOCAL BARONS REGULATING EVERY ASPECT OF PERSONAL LIFE, SOMETIMES EVICTING, SOMETIMES SQUEEZING MONEY, SOMETIMES TOLERATING FOR BRIEF PERIODS TO OBTAIN SOME SPECIFIC GAIN. ALL OF THIS GAVE LIFE A DREADFUL UNCERTAINTY. HOW THE JEWS KEPT THEIR SANITY AND FAITH IS A GENUINE MIRACLE.

3. AN ESCAPE FROM THIS PRESSURE SLOWLY DAWNED ABOUT TWO HUNDRED YEARS AGO. IN THE NEW WORLD THE AMERICAN REVOLUTION WAS BREATHING NEW SLOGANS OF FREEDOM. IN THE OLD WORLD THE FRENCH REVOLUTION OFFERED LIBERTY AND EQUALITY AT A PRICE. NAPOLEON BROUGHT IT ALL TO A CLIMAX IN 1807 WHEN HE CONVENED A SANHEDRIN, ASKED HIS FAMOUS 12 QUESTIONS, GOT SATISFACTORY ANSWERS - AND OPENED THE DOORS OF FULL EMANCIPATION AND CITIZENSHIP TO THE JEWS, WHO RUSHED HEADLONG INTO THE BRIGHT LIGHT OF FREEDOM AT LAST, EAGERLY AND GLADLY PAYING THE PRICE DEMANDED. WHAT WAS THE PRICE? ~~ESSENCE OF THE 12 QUESTIONS?~~ THE JEWS WERE ASKED TO ASSIMILATE, TO CONSIDER THEMSELVES FRENCHMEN ABOVE ALL ELSE, TO CONSIDER THE FRENCH AS THEIR BROTHERS, TO BE WILLING TO DIE FOR FRANCE AS THEIR NATION, TO CONSIDER THEMSELVES JEWS BY RELIGION ONLY, THUS GIVING UP THEIR

HISTORIC MEMORIES AS AN ANCIENT PEOPLE WITH TIES TO PALESTINE, AND TO PERMIT MIXED MARRIAGES UNDER CIVIL LAW. IN THEIR EAGERNESS TO ESCAPE FROM THE MISERY OF THE PAST THOUSAND YEARS, THE RABBIS AND LAY LEADERS WHO SAT IN THAT SANHEDRIN BOUGHT THE FULL PACKAGE, AND STARTED THE JEWISH PEOPLE DOWN THE SLIPPERY PATH OF ASSIMILATION AS THE PRICE FOR EQUALITY.

4. AFTER A HUNDRED YEARS OF TRYING TO LIVE LIKE A JEW INSIDE HIS OWN HOUSE, AND LIKE A FRENCHMAN, ENGLISHMAN, GERMAN, AMERICAN OUTSIDE ON THE STREET - THE JEWISH PEOPLE COLLECTIVELY BEGAN TO REALIZE THAT THE PRICE FOR FREEDOM MAY HAVE BEEN TOO HIGH IF IT WERE TO RESULT IN THE WEAKENING OF JEWISH LOYALTY, KNOWLEDGE AND SURVIVAL INSTINCT. IT BECAME CLEAR THAT THERE MUST BE A REVERSION TO THE PRINCIPLES OF JEWISH NATIONAL EXISTENCE, IF POSSIBLE WITHOUT LOSING THE WONDERFUL ADVANTAGES OF THE OTHER NATIONAL EXISTENCES IN WHICH JEWS WERE BEGINNING TO PARTICIPATE FULLY. AHAD HA-AM CALLED FOR THE CREATION OF A SPIRITUAL CENTER IN PALESTINE TO REJUVENATE THE HEBREW LANGUAGE AND THE HEBREW PROPHETIC SPIRIT; THEODORE HERZL CALLED FOR A POLITICAL CHARTER TO BE GRANTED BY THE SULTAN FOR A JEWISH REBUILDING IN THE ANCIENT LAND NOW PART OF THE TURKISH EMPIRE; CHAIM WEIZMANN CALLED FOR THE PRACTICAL ZIONIST

WORK OF BUILDING ^{ONE} ~~A~~ SETTLEMENT AT A TIME TO REPOPULATE THE COUNTRY. ALL OF THIS WAS INTENDED TO REVERSE THE SWING OF THE ASSIMILATIONIST PENDULUM, AND TO ACHIEVE THE MOST RADICAL OF ALL GOALS - FOR JEWS TO BE FREE IN THEIR OWN LAND, NOT ONLY TO BE GIVEN EQUAL RIGHTS IN EVERY OTHER LAND ON EARTH.

5. AFTER HALF A CENTURY OF PREPARATORY WORK, THE MIRACLE OF STATEHOOD OCCURRED THROUGH A COMBINATION OF VERY HARD POLITICAL ^{LOBBYING} ~~WORK~~ AND A VERY COSTLY WAR OF INDEPENDENCE. SOME SAY THE HOLOCAUST WHICH ENDED IN 1945 PRODUCED THE U.N. PARTITION RESOLUTION OF 1947. OTHERS SAY IT IS A TRIVIALIZATION OF THE MONUMENTAL SLAUGHTER TO LINK ^{THE HOLOCAUST} ~~IT~~ WITH THE CREATION OF THE STATE. TO DISCUSS THIS IN DEPTH ^{WOULD TAKE ON} ~~WILL LEAD US TO~~ A LONG DIGRESSION. ONE THING IS CLEAR - THE STATE WAS BORN IN BLOOD - THE BLOOD OF ONE PERSON OUT OF EVERY HUNDRED WHO LIVED IN ISRAEL IN 1948, AND I BELIEVE THE BLOOD OF ONE JEW OUT OF EVERY THREE IN THE ENTIRE WORLD WHO HAD DIED IN THE HITLER PERIOD.

6. THE GLORIOUS REBIRTH INFUSED THE ENTIRE JEWISH PEOPLE WITH A NEW ZEST FOR LIFE, A NEW SPIRIT, A NEW ADVENTURE, A NEW DEFINITION OF SELF. WE WERE ANGRY AT WHAT THE WORLD HAD DONE TO US, SO WE ATTACKED THE SOIL AND VENTILATED ANGER ON THE ROCKS AND MADE THINGS GROW AND CHANGED THE COLOR FROM BROWN DESERT TO BLUE IRRIGATION DITCHES AND GREEN FIELDS.

WE WERE ANGRY THAT THE SURROUNDING NEIGHBORS HAD TRIED TO STRANGLE US AT BIRTH, SO WE FASHIONED WEAPONS AND LEARNED HOW TO USE THEM, AND FOUGHT OFF THE ASSAULT OF WAR AFTER WAR. TODAY, ISRAEL IS THE FOURTH STRONGEST MILITARY POWER ON EARTH, AFTER RUSSIA, AMERICA AND CHINA. IMAGINE THAT. WE WERE ANGRY THAT THERE WERE JEWS IN OTHER COUNTRIES UNSAFE AND ILL AT EASE, SO WE THREW OUR DOORS OPEN, ERECTED TENTS ^{FOR NEWCOMERS} AND EVENTUALLY HOUSES, SCHOOLS AND HOSPITALS, ~~MORE~~ FARMS AND FACTORIES. A THIRD OF A CENTURY, SUCH A SHORT TIME, HAS SEEN THE MOST INCREDIBLE NATION-BUILDING TO TAKE PLACE ANYWHERE ON THIS PLANET. SUCH A MIXTURE OF BRAINS AND MONEY, ANGER AND PRIDE, VISION AND PRACTICALITY - ALL POURED IN FAST - WITH AN EXPLOSIVE POWER HITHERTO UNFELT IN A PEOPLE ESSENTIALLY ASLEEP FOR A THOUSAND YEARS AND GROPING FOR THE LAST HUNDRED YEARS - HAS RESULTED IN THE MODERN PHENOMENON CALLED ISRAEL - A PEOPLE'S ASSERTION OF ITS OWN FUTURE DIRECTION AND ITS POTENTIAL CONTRIBUTION TO OTHER PEOPLES IN AFRICA AND ASIA ALSO YEARNING TO CREATE.

7. AND YES, IN SOME DIM AND NOT YET FULLY ARTICULATED MANNER, WE EVEN SEE THAT REBORN ISRAEL MAY BE THE ANSWER TO THE DILEMMA OF THE ASSIMILATION WHICH STILL PLAGUES THE WESTERN JEW LIVING IN FREEDOM IN THE LANDS OF THE DIASPORA WHERE HE HAS SUCCESSFULLY PROGRESSED AND ADJUSTED.

ISRAEL, THROUGH ^{THE}~~ITS~~ FUTURE EFFECTS OF CREATING A NEW UNIVERSAL LANGUAGE, HEBREW; THROUGH ^{ITS}~~THE~~ UNIVERSITIES WHICH CAN ABSORB THOUSANDS OF DIASPORA STUDENTS; THROUGH ITS TEACHING OF JUDAISM IN HUNDREDS OF INSTITUTES; THROUGH ITS NETWORK OF LINKS AND CONNECTIONS BETWEEN MILLIONS OF JEWS INSIDE AND OUTSIDE, WILL HOPEFULLY RESTORE ^{FOR JEWS} THAT BALANCE BETWEEN LIVING A LOYAL AND MEANINGFUL JEWISH LIFE IN THE DIASPORA, AS WELL AS A SINCERE PATRIOTIC EXISTENCE IN ^{THEIR VARIOUS} THE NATIONS OF RESIDENCE. ~~IF CONFLICTS OCCUR BETWEEN A PARTICULAR STATE AND THE STATE OF ISRAEL, THE JEWS OF THAT PARTICULAR STATE WILL HAVE TO DECIDE WHERE THEIR INTERESTS LIE, AND ACT ACCORDINGLY. IT IS TO BE HOPED THAT SUCH CONFLICTS CAN BE AVOIDED BY WISE STATESMANSHIP.~~

8. BECAUSE THE SIGNIFICANCE OF ISRAEL TO ALMOST EVERY JEW IS SO DEEP, AND BECAUSE THE ACHIEVEMENTS OF MODERN ISRAEL HAVE BEEN SO BREATHTAKING, AND BECAUSE THE BRIGHT STAR IS SO ATTRACTIVE, JEWS ALL OVER THE WORLD HAVE SUPPORTED ISRAEL WITH ZEST AND VIGOR, WITH MONEY AND MORALE, WITH POLITICAL, SOCIAL, TECHNICAL HELP - AND HAVE DONE SO WITH GREAT ENTHUSIASM AND CONSTANT EFFORT, ENJOYING EVERY MINUTE OF IT.

9. SUDDENLY, FOR THE FIRST TIME, SOMETHING HAPPENED WHICH CAUSED A BREAK IN THAT STEADY FLOW OF INTELLECTUAL AND MORAL SUPPORT. DISSATISFACTION WITH ISRAELI POLICIES BEGAN TO BE FELT A FEW YEARS AGO, WHEN

THE PRIME MINISTER MADE MANIFEST WHAT HE MEANT BY AUTONOMY IN THE WEST BANK, WHICH HE CALLED BY THE BIBLICAL NAMES OF JUDEA AND SAMARIA. THE VERY USE OF THESE NAMES EXPRESSED CLEARLY HIS CONCEPT THAT THEY WERE AN INTEGRAL PART OF MODERN ISRAEL BECAUSE THEY HAD ONCE BEEN PART OF THE BIBLICAL KINGDOMS OF DAVID AND SOLOMON. THIS WAS CONSISTENT WITH HIS ATTITUDE TOWARD ESTABLISHING SETTLEMENTS IN THE WEST BANK, WHICH FACT CAUSED SEVERE IRRITATIONS WITH THE UNITED STATES AND WESTERN EUROPE, BECAUSE IT APPEARED TO BE A POLICY OF CREEPING ANNEXATION IN DIRECT CONFLICT WITH ISRAEL'S STATED WILLINGNESS TO GRANT THE ARABS IN THE WEST BANK ^{THEIR} AUTONOMY. THE CONTRADICTION HERE CAUSED MANY CRITICS TO SAY THAT THE PRIME MINISTER WHO SET THE TONE, THE AGRICULTURE MINISTER (ARIEL SHARON) WHO CARRIED OUT THE SETTLEMENT POLICY, AND THE MAJORITY OF THE RIGHT-WING PLUS RELIGIOUS PARTIES CABINET WHICH APPROVED THESE ACTIONS WERE ALL IN A CONSPIRACY TO VIOLATE THE SPIRIT OF THE CAMP DAVID ACCORDS WHILE AT THE SAME TIME PAYING LIP-SERVICE TO THEIR SANCTITY. TO MANY ^{DIASPORA} JEWS AND ISRAELIS ALIKE, THIS SEEMED HYPOCRITICAL, SLEAZY, DISHONEST AND PROVOCATIVE. DISCONTENT AND UNEASINESS BEGAN TO BE FELT, IN MEASURABLE QUANTITY AND QUALITY FOR THE FIRST TIME, AMONG FRIENDS AND SUPPORTERS.

10. OF COURSE, THERE WERE LARGE NUMBERS, BOTH INSIDE AND OUTSIDE ISRAEL WHO SUPPORTED THESE POLICIES. A LEGITIMATE MAJORITY OF THE ISRAELI ELECTORATE VOTED FOR THE PRIME MINISTER AND HIS COALITION. A LARGE PORTION OF DIASPORA JEWRY AGREED WITH THE THRUST AND DIRECTION, FEELING THAT THE IRRITATIONS AND DISAGREEMENTS WITH THE UNITED STATES WERE NEITHER CRITICAL NOR EVEN SERIOUS. ONE HEARD THE STATEMENT FROM BOTH AMERICAN AND ISRAELI OFFICIALS THAT TRUE ALLIES OFTEN DISAGREED ON ^{SPECIFIC ISSUES} ~~MATTERS~~ BUT THE FUNDAMENTAL RELATIONSHIP OF MUTUAL RESPECT AND INTER-DEPENDENCE WAS NOT IN JEOPARDY.

11. MATTERS CONTINUED THIS WAY FOR SEVERAL YEARS - MUTTERINGS OF PROTEST AND MURMURINGS OF SUPPORT - UNTIL THE LEBANESE WAR THIS PAST SUMMER, CULMINATING IN THE SHATILA-SABRA CAMP MASSACRE IN WEST BEIRUT ON ^{THURSDAY} ~~FRIDAY~~ ^{THROUGH} ~~AND~~ SATURDAY, ¹⁶⁻ SEPTEMBER 18TH, ROSH HASHONAH OF ALL DAYS. THEN JEWISH PROTEST EXPLODED. IT WOULD NOT BE CONTAINED. THE DEEPEST CURRENTS OF THAT WONDERFULLY SENSITIVE JEWISH CONSCIENCE HAD BEEN STIRRED AND EVEN THOUGH NOT A SINGLE ISRAELI SOLDIER HAD BEEN PERSONALLY INVOLVED IN THE MASSACRE INSIDE THE CAMPS, A HOWL OF PROTEST AROSE FROM A JEWISH PUBLIC ALL OVER THE WORLD, WHICH QUICKLY FORCED THE PRIME MINISTER TO RETREAT AND TO CALL FOR AN OFFICIAL COURT OF INQUIRY WHICH HAS ALREADY

BEGUN ITS HEARINGS. SO THE MATTER IS SUB-JUDICE AND THEREFORE I WILL LEAVE IT. WE SHALL HAVE ITS FINDINGS WITHIN TWO MONTHS.

12. THE SUBJECT FOR US TO ANALYZE MOST DEEPLY IS THIS QUESTION OF DISSENT. THE KEY ISSUE TO HAVE SURFACED IN ~~THIS WHOLE EVENT~~ ^{THE RECENT PAST} IS THE RIGHT OF JEWS WHO LIVE IN THE DIASPORA TO EXPRESS DISAGREEMENT, PRIVATELY OR PUBLICLY, WITH ANNOUNCED POLICIES OF A DEMOCRATICALLY-ELECTED GOVERNMENT IN ISRAEL. THE LINES OF THE ARGUMENT ARE VERY CLEAR. ONE POSITION IS THAT ONLY THOSE WHO LIVE IN ISRAEL, VOTE IN ITS ELECTIONS, PAY ITS TAXES, SHED BLOOD IN ITS WARS HAVE THE RIGHT TO AN OPINION. THAT POSITION IS HELD BY MOST JEWS OF THE DIASPORA, AND MOST OF ISRAEL'S HIGHEST OFFICIALS. BECAUSE THAT IS THE POSITION OF THE LARGE MAJORITY, IT HAS PREVAILED FOR SO LONG. THE OPPOSITE POSITION IS THAT ALL JEWS /IN THE WORLD WHO FEEL THE GREAT SURGES OF LOVE FOR AND PRIDE IN ISRAEL WHICH HAVE PRODUCED THEIR SUPPORT IN EVERY FORM HAVE THE RIGHT, NAY, THE DUTY, TO EXPRESS AN OPINION. FAILURE TO DO SO REPRESENTS DEFAULT, AND WILL CAUSE EROSION OF THE SLOGAN "WE ARE ONE". WE ARE NOT ONE, IF THE DIASPORA ^{PORTION} ~~POSITION~~ OF THE JEWISH PEOPLE IS FORCED TO BE SILENT. ~~AND FINALLY~~, SILENCE LENDS AGREEMENT. THAT IS THE MEANING OF THE WORD ACQUIESCENCE. IF ISRAEL BELONGS ONLY TO THE JEWS WHO LIVE THERE, ^{AND ALL OTHERS MUST ACQUIESCE,} THEN THE SPLITTING OF THE JEWISH PEOPLE WILL BE THE INEVITABLE AND TRAGIC

OUTCOME OF THE WHOLE ZIONIST EFFORT OF THE PAST CENTURY. HOW IRONIC
IT WOULD BE IF THE STRUGGLE TO BUILD A HOMELAND FOR THE PHYSICAL AND
SPIRITUAL SECURITY OF THE WHOLE JEWISH PEOPLE WERE TO RESULT IN A

SEPARATION OF ISRAEL'S JEWS FROM DIASPORA JEWS. ^{IF} ~~ONCE~~ ^{SEPARATED AND} BOTH PARTS WENT

THEIR ^(INDIVIDUAL) ~~SEPARATE~~ HISTORIC WAYS, WHO KNOWS WHERE, WHEN OR HOW THEY WOULD

EVER BE REJOINED. THE GHOSTLY LAUGHTER OF OUR ENEMIES ^{MIGHT} ~~CAN~~ BE HEARD ^{coming} ~~in~~

^{From}
THE CENTURIES AHEAD.



13. ISRAELI OFFICIALS, WHETHER IN THE GOVERNMENT OR THE JEWISH AGENCY OR THE ARMY OR ANY MAJOR INSTITUTION OR NEWSPAPER OR PUBLIC BODY, WHO SAY THAT DIASPORA JEWS SHOULD NOT TAKE PART IN EXPRESSING OPINIONS ~~AND~~ OR ~~EVEN~~ TRYING TO INFLUENCE POLICY ON INTERNAL ISRAELI AFFAIRS, AND WHO RATIONALIZE THAT ATTITUDE BY THE CONVENTIONAL WISDOM THAT JEWS WHO STAY OUTSIDE THROUGH FREE CHOICE CANNOT, AT THE SAME TIME, ACT AS INSIDERS, HAVE DECIDED THAT UNITY IS A MYTH AND THEY ARE WILLING FRANKLY TO SAY THAT THERE ARE TWO DISTINCT CATEGORIES OF JEWS WHO, LIKE REMOTE COUSINS, FIND THAT THEY REALLY DO NOT HAVE MUCH TO SAY TO EACH OTHER WHEN THEY MEET INFREQUENTLY ON SOME FAMILY OCCASION. WOE TO THOSE OFFICIALS WHO MAKE SUCH A DECISION, FOR THEY ARE DOOMING THE HEALTHY FUTURE OF THE JEWISH PEOPLE, AND ALSO, NOT UNIMPORTANTLY, DOOMING THE FUTURE OF ISRAEL, OR AT LEAST RELEGATING IT TO SOME BALKAN EXISTENCE. ISRAELI OFFICIALS WHO TAKE SUCH A POSITION, NO MATTER HOW HIGHLY PLACED THEY MAY BE, ARE BLIND IN THEIR CHAUVINISM, MYOPIC IN THEIR NARROW NATIONALISM, AND ARROGANT IN THEIR JUDGEMENT. NO MATTER HOW FRUSTRATED THEY MAY BE BY THE FAILURE OF WESTERN AND RUSSIAN JEWS TO MIGRATE TO ISRAEL IN LARGE NUMBERS; NO MATTER HOW ANNOYED THEY MAY BE AT THE UNFAIRNESS OF THE SHARE OF THE DEFENSE AND ECONOMIC BURDEN THEY MUST CARRY COMPARED TO

THE DIASPORA SEGMENT; NO MATTER HOW WEARY OR HEARTSICK THEY MAY BE AT THE DIFFICULTY OF THE STRUGGLE TO GROW AND PROGRESS; NO MATTER THE LEGITIMACY OF ALL THESE AND MANY MORE EMOTIONS THEY ^{MAY} FEEL - THERE IS NO EXCUSE FOR LEADERS IN ISRAEL TODAY TO HAVE LOST THEIR SENSE OF HISTORY, WHICH SHOULD TELL THEM THAT A DIVIDED KINGDOM IS WEAK AND DOES NOT ENDURE WHILE A UNITED KINGDOM PRODUCES GLORY AND CREATIVITY. NO - WHEN ISRAELI JEWS DISPLAY A TURNING INWARD AND A DENIAL OF EQUALITY, DIASPORA JEWS MUST SPEAK OUT BLUNTLY AND STRONGLY THAT THIS IS NOT THE WAY TO THE UNITED FUTURE, BUT WILL LEAD TO IRREVOCABLE ^{FRAGMENTATION OF} ~~DISPERSION~~.

14. BUT THE PROBLEM WITH DIASPORA JEWS IS THAT THEY DO NOT SPEAK OUT BLUNTLY AND STRONGLY, AT LEAST NOT UNTIL VERY RECENTLY. IF THE ERROR IN THE ISRAELI ATTITUDE IS ONE OF TENDING TOWARD ARROGANCE, THE ERROR IN THE DIASPORA ATTITUDE IS ONE OF TENDING TOWARD SUBSERVIENCE. THE DIASPORA JEW ^{THE DIASPORA JEW} "COPS OUT" IN THE VERNACULAR PHRASE, BY HIMSELF SHRINKING BEHIND THE SAME CLICHES. ^{HE} SAYS - I DON'T SERVE IN THE ARMY, SO WHAT RIGHT HAVE I TO SAY WHETHER ISRAEL SHOULD OR SHOULD NOT GO INTO WEST BEIRUT. HE SAYS - I DON'T VOTE AND ELECT A GOVERNMENT, SO WHAT RIGHT HAVE I ^{HE} TO SAY WHAT ISRAEL'S FOREIGN POLICY SHOULD BE TOWARD AMERICA OR CHINA OR ANY PLACE ELSE. HE SAYS - I DON'T LIVE THERE OR SPEAK THE LANGUAGE OR KNOW THE INNER DETAILS OF DAILY LIFE, SO WHAT RIGHT HAVE I

TO EXPRESS OPINIONS OR TRY TO SHAPE SOCIAL OR ECONOMIC OR ETHNIC OR EDUCATIONAL MATTERS. ALL OF THIS COYNESS AND WITHDRAWAL AND SELF-IMPOSED RETICENCE ON THE PART OF THE DIASPORA JEW IS THE MIRROR IMAGE OF THE CHAUVINISM OF THE ISRAELI JEW AND IS EQUALLY WRONG. IF THE DIASPORA JEWS CONTINUE FOR LONG ALONG THE LINES OF KEEPING SILENT AND WITHDRAWING, THEY WILL BE JUST AS GUILTY AS THEIR ISRAELI COUNTERPARTS OF SPLITTING THE JEWISH NATION. AMERICAN JEWISH ARCHIVES DIASPORA JEWS MUST OVERCOME THEIR SHYNESS; ISRAELI JEWS MUST WELCOME THEIR PARTICIPATION; AND THE PRICE OF THIS CLOSENESS WILL BE CONFLICT, WHICH WOULD BE WONDERFUL, FOR OUT OF SUCH FRICTION WILL COME PROGRESS AND GROWTH.

15. TWO QUESTIONS OF ^{TYPE} LIMIT MUST BE CONSIDERED. WHAT ~~KIND~~ OF DIASPORA JEW HAS THE RIGHT TO TAKE PART DEEPLY, SERIOUSLY, PROVOCATIVELY IN ISRAEL'S INTERNAL AFFAIRS; AND IN WHAT MANNER SHOULD HE/SHE TAKE PART? THE ANSWERS DICTATED BY COMMON SENSE ARE THE MOST USEFUL. THE DIASPORA JEW WHO CARES DEEPLY, FEELS DEEPLY, BELIEVES DEEPLY IN THE CENTRALITY AND IMPORTANCE OF ISRAEL IS OBVIOUSLY THE ONE WHO WILL BE MOST UPSET WHEN SOMETHING SEEMS WRONG TO HIM AND HE IS EXACTLY THE ONE WHO HAS EVERY RIGHT TO ARGUE, FIGHT, DISAGREE, SPEAK OUT, SEEK TO MAKE HIS OPINION FELT. HE HAS A RIGHT BECAUSE HE CARES. FURTHER, HIS CONDUCT

MUST DEMONSTRATE THAT HE CARES. HIS FINANCIAL SUPPORT; HIS POLITICAL ACTION VIS-A-VIS THE GOVERNMENT WHOSE CITIZEN HE IS; HIS MORAL INFLUENCE ON OTHER JEWS AND ALSO NON-JEWS; HIS FREQUENT VISITS TO ISRAEL; HIS CHILDREN STUDYING THERE - ALL THESE AND MANY OTHER SPECIFIC DEEDS ARE THE CREDENTIALS HE OFFERS THAT HIS CARING IS NOT MERELY INTELLECTUAL OR EMOTIONAL BUT IS ALSO PRACTICAL. HE HAS EARNED HIS STRIPES AND THUS HIS RIGHTS.

I KNOW THERE ARE THOSE WHO WOULD CLAIM THAT SUCH "PROOFS OF LOYALTY" ARE NOT NECESSARY AND EVERY JEW, BY VIRTUE OF BIRTH, IS ENTITLED TO THE INNER PARTICIPATION WE ARE DISCUSSING. BUT I WOULD PREFER TO BE STRICTER IN ORDER TO STRENGTHEN THE CASE. MY STRICTNESS LIMITS THE CATEGORY, FOR I WISH THE PROCESS OF MUTUALITY AND DIALOGUE REALLY TO START, NOT ON THE POLITE LEVEL OF SOME PRE-ARRANGED SEMINAR ONCE A YEAR, BUT ON THE DAILY LEVEL OF LIFE'S BATTLEFIELD. SO, LET US START AT LEAST WITH THOSE WHOSE CREDENTIALS ARE INDISPUTABLE. LATER, WE CAN RELAX THE CRITERIA.

16. THE HARDER QUESTION CONCERNS THE MANNER OF DISSENT - SHOULD IT BE PUBLIC OR ONLY PRIVATE? HERE THE ARGUMENT RAGES HOTLY. THOSE WHO FEEL PASSIONATELY SAY THAT ONCE THE RIGHT TO DISSENT IS ESTABLISHED, IT IS SHAMEFUL AND IGNOBLE NOT TO BE ABLE TO EXPRESS IT ON OP-ED PAGES, IN OPEN TV INTERVIEWS AND AT STUDENT ASSEMBLIES IN UNIVERSITIES. TO GRANT ONESSELF THE RIGHT TO SPEAK OUT, BUT THEN TO CONFINE ONESSELF TO INTERNAL JEWISH AUDIENCES OR AT MOST TO STRICTLY JEWISH PUBLICATIONS IS THE HEIGHT OF SELF-GHETTOIZATION. LOGIC GIVES CREDENCE TO THIS POINT OF VIEW. THERE IS NO SUCH THING AS BEING A LITTLE BIT PREGNANT. ONCE AN INDIVIDUAL OR AN ORGANIZATION CONCLUDES THAT HE SERVES HIS OWN CONSCIENCE AND THE GENERAL CAUSE OF JUDAISM AND ISRAEL BETTER BY CRITICIZING AND OFFERING SUGGESTIONS AND DEMANDING CHANGES, THEN IT FOLLOWS THAT THE MORE WIDELY HE SPREADS HIS VIEWS AND SEEKS TO PERSUADE OTHERS OF THEIR VALIDITY, THE MORE IS HE SERVING THE RIGHT AS HE SEES IT. IT SEEMS FOOLISH AND FRUSTRATING TO CONCEDE TO HIM THE RIGHT TO SPEAK, BUT TO INSIST THAT HE DO SO IN THE PRIVACY OF HIS OWN CIRCLES.

THOSE WHO INSIST UPON THE PRIVATE APPROACH USE AS THEIR STRONGEST ARGUMENT THE FACT THAT PUBLIC ATTACK BY DIASPORA JEWS AGAINST SOME POLICY OR PERSONALITY OF ISRAEL GIVES AID AND COMFORT TO ISRAEL'S

ENEMIES, EITHER IN THE ARAB WORLD, THE THIRD WORLD, ^{or} ~~IN~~ EVEN THE WASHINGTON WORLD. IF A JEW SAYS SOMETHING PUBLICLY IN DISAGREEMENT WITH ISRAEL, IT IS ARGUED THAT THIS IMMEDIATELY PLACES AMMUNITION IN THE HANDS OF → AN ENEMY. A SOLID FRONT MUST BE MAINTAINED AT ALL COSTS, SO SAY THE DEFENDERS OF SILENCE. AND THE ARGUMENT IS POWERFUL, FOR NO ONE WHO CARES ENOUGH ABOUT ISRAEL TO BECOME EMBROILED IN THIS WHOLE CONTROVERSY, WANTS TO HAVE IT ON HIS CONSCIENCE THAT HE MAY HAVE DONE OR SAID SOMETHING WHICH COULD BE EXPLOITED TO HURT ISRAEL. THE STRENGTH OF THIS ARGUMENT HAS BEEN OVERWHELMING UP TO NOW.

^{BUT} A FEW BRAVE SOULS HAVE WRITTEN TO THE NEW YORK TIMES, GIVEN PUBLIC INTERVIEWS TO THE JERUSALEM POST, MADE SPEECHES WHICH WERE QUOTED IN THE GENERAL MEDIA, ^{AND ISRAEL HAS} ~~THE SHOCK WAVES REVERBERATED;~~ ISRAEL DID NOT COLLAPSE. ^{HAS} THE ENEMY FOUND LITTLE UPON WHICH TO SEIZE. INTELLIGENT AND CIVILIZED MEN AND WOMEN THE WORLD OVER UNDERSTAND PERFECTLY WELL THAT JEWISH OPINION IS NOT MONOLITHIC - AND, AS A MATTER OF FACT, IT IS AN INSULT TO INTELLIGENCE TO TRY TO GIVE THE IMPRESSION THAT THE ENTIRE JEWISH PEOPLE REACTS AUTOMATICALLY WITH ONE RESPONSE TO EVERY ISRAELI STIMULUS. WE ARE A VIBRANT PEOPLE WITH VARIEGATED OPINIONS AND STUBBORN STREAKS. ALL - EVEN OUR ENEMIES - KNOW THIS ABOUT US. TO PRETEND THAT

WE ALL MARCH TO ONE DRUM IS ABSURD. ONE OF THE ATTRACTIVE ASPECTS OF OUR COLLECTIVE PERSONA IS THE ARGUMENTATIVE NATURE OF OUR INTELLECT.

NO - IT IS BECOMING EVER CLEARER THAT DISSENT WILL INEVITABLY TAKE A MORE AND MORE PUBLIC FORM - AND I THINK THIS IS PROPER, SO LONG AS THE BOUNDS OF CLEAR THINKING, RATIONAL DISCUSSION, NOT OVER-HEATED EMOTION, GOOD TASTE, ALL PREVAIL, ^{FURTHER, THAT} AND ALL DISSENT BE TEMPERED WITH CONTINUOUS ^{REPEATED} RESPECTED STATEMENTS OF OUR BASIC LOVE, IDENTIFICATION AND SUPPORT FOR THE VERY ISRAEL WE MAY BE CRITICIZING AT THE MOMENT FOR SOME PARTICULAR REASON.

17. ~~HAVING SAID ALL THIS~~, LET ME CONCLUDE WITH THE FINAL POINT TO WHICH LOGIC DRAWS US -- NAMELY THE DUTY TO DISSENT. IT IS NOT ONLY A MATTER OF RIGHT, IT IS A MATTER OF OBLIGATION. ALL OF US WHO WORK SO HARD FOR THE COUNTRY ARE MOTIVATED BY THE DESIRE TO SEE HER GROW AND IMPROVE AND SUCCEED -- SO WE GIVE OUR EFFORT AND ENERGY AND MONEY. BUT WE MUST ALSO GIVE OUR SUGGESTIONS AND OPINIONS AND THOUGHTS AND ATTITUDES. IT IS OUR DUTY TO CONTRIBUTE THESE PRECIOUS INTANGIBLE ASSETS. SHOULD WE BE MERELY RUBBER-STAMPS? THIS WILL NOT SUSTAIN OUR ENTHUSIASM. SHOULD WE BE PARTNERS IN SHALLOW SLOGANS ONLY? THIS WILL LEAD TO BOREDOM AND DISINTEREST. TRUE, LASTING, SINCERE INVOLVEMENT CAN BE SUSTAINED FOR

A PERSON'S LIFETIME ONLY IF THERE IS A LIVING AND ORGANIC RELATIONSHIP. WE HAVE A DUTY TO PARTICIPATE IN THE INTERNAL QUARRELS, FOR WHAT FAMILY IS WITHOUT THEM? A PERSON WHO SEPARATES FROM THE CONTROVERSIES RAGING AROUND THE TABLE IS A STRANGER, NOT A MEMBER OF THAT FAMILY. YOUR DUTY IS TO ENTER INTO THE DEEPEST DEPTHS OF THE ARGUMENT, AND WHEN IT IS OVER YOU HAVE CONTRIBUTED YOUR PASSION, YOUR PERSONALITY, EVERYTHING YOU HAVE. THE DECISION IS THEN YOURS AS WELL, AND THEREAFTER YOU WILL FEEL BOUND TO HELP CARRY IT OUT.

MR. EBAN IS OPPOSED TO MR. BEGIN'S POLICY OF ESTABLISHING SETTLEMENTS IN THE WEST BANK. HE DECIDED TO GO PUBLIC WITH HIS OPPOSITION AND HAS BEEN ATTACKING THE POLICY FIERCELY. HE BELIEVES THIS POLICY WILL LEAD TO A LOSS OF ISRAEL'S JEWISH AND DEMOCRATIC CHARACTER. HE BELIEVES IT WILL LEAD TO ISRAEL'S ISOLATION AND CAUSE ISRAEL TO BE GUILTY OF VIOLATING HER INTERNATIONAL OBLIGATIONS. SO HE FIGHTS THE POLICY.

IN EXPLANATION OF HIS DECISION TO GO PUBLIC, HE RECENTLY WROTE: "THERE IS NO HIGHER PATRIOTISM THAN THAT INVOLVED IN THE STRUGGLE TO RESTORE THE IMAGE OF A JEWISH DEMOCRATIC STATE SEEKING TO BRING ITS INTERESTS INTO A DEGREE OF HARMONY WITH THE INTERESTS OF OTHERS."

PROFESSOR JACOB NEUSNER OF BROWN UNIVERSITY SUMMED IT UP IN A

start here RECENT ARTICLE. "I OPPOSED THE SIX-DAY WAR, DECLARING IT NEEDLESS.

WITH MY WONDERFUL MAZEL, MY LETTER TO THE NEW YORK TIMES APPEARED THE DAY BEFORE THE WAR BROKE OUT. I HAVE ALWAYS OPPOSED THE SETTLEMENTS IN THE WEST BANK, AND MY LETTER ON THE OP-ED PAGE OF THE TIMES APPEARED JUST BEFORE THE YOM KIPPUR WAR. I WROTE IN ZIONIST MAGAZINES IN THE LATE 60'S THAT WE MUST MAKE AN ACCOMODATION TO THE ARABS ON JERUSALEM AND THIS WAS A SMALL PRICE FOR PEACE.

WHEN THE LEBANESE WAR BROKE OUT LAST JUNE, I DOUBLED MY CONTRIBUTION TO THE JEWISH FEDERATION OF RHODE ISLAND. IT WAS NOT TO HELP PAY FOR THE WAR OR EVEN TO SIGNIFY APPROVAL. IT WAS BECAUSE I BELIEVED IN ISRAEL.

IT DOES NOT MEAN I MUST APPROVE EVERYTHING THE STATE OF ISRAEL DOES OR SUPPORT TO THE LAST DETAIL THE LEAST POSITION OF THE CURRENT ELECTED OFFICIAL IN THE STATE. IT DOES MEAN THAT I MUST OPPOSE THE THINGS I THINK ARE WRONG AND SUPPORT THE THINGS I THINK ARE RIGHT.

WHATEVER THE ISRAELIS DO, MY CONCERN IS UNCONDITIONAL. BECAUSE I CARED, I CRITICIZED. BECAUSE I SHALL ALWAYS CARE, I SHALL GIVE MORE TODAY THAN EVER IN THE PAST, TO SHOW THAT LOVE IS UNCONDITIONAL, THAT COMMITMENT, CONCERN AND CARING COUNT MOST WHEN MOST TESTED."

To me that is the healthiest attitude of all. ^{Do both} Criticize and support, dissent and encourage, disagree and commit. Don't be silent, don't "cup out", don't feel inhibited - say what you feel without any sense of disloyalty. It's your Israel too, even though you remain in the Diaspora. But always remember that if it is your Israel too, then it needs your loving care, your deepest concern, your steadfast and eternal backing.

Act in this manner, and you will influence policies, correct imbalances, ^{add} ~~bring~~ an international perspective - all of which will make Israel move more steadily toward that wonderful ^{condition} ~~future~~ we wish for her - ^{to be} safe & secure, a genuine democracy, socially and economically healthy, giving happiness to her citizens, ^{giving} pride and ^{self-}respect to all other Jews in the world, and providing that light to the nations which is the eternal dream and mission of the ~~of~~ ~~same~~ State. It's since the days of the Bible. All this can and will be achieved.

NOVEMBER 1982 CLAMBAKE ATTENDANCE

Aaron, Albert
3908 N. Charles St.
Baltimore, MD 21218

Brotsky, Gary
950 Rhodes Ave.
Akron, OH 44307

Arsham, Edwin
22655 Chagrin Blvd. #308
Beachwood, OH 44122

Chalfie, Ivan
1701 E. 110th St.
Indianapolis, IN 46280

Axner, Fred
186 Court Dr.
Akron, OH 44313

Cutler, Herman
191 Presidential Blvd.
Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

Belford, Arthur
3390 West 86th St.
Indianapolis, IN 46268

Dolgin, Stanley
3675 Indian Rd.
Toledo, OH 43606

Belman, Morrie
5903 Som Center Rd.
Solon, OH 44139

Doll, Irving
2444 Madison Rd.
Cincinnati, OH 45208

Belman, William
24 Hunting Hollow Dr.
Cleveland, OH 44124

Eisenburg, Joe
2877 E. Broad St.
Columbus, OH 43209

Benis, Joseph MD
2265 N. Cassidy Ave.
Columbus, OH 43219

Fox, Louis
6633 Security Blvd.
Baltimore, MD 21207

Berman, Alan
9824 E. Washington St.
Chagrin Falls, OH 44022

Fredrix, William MD
1865 S. Ocian Dr. #3B
Hallandale, FL 33009

Bloch, Michael
185 S. Columbia Ave.
Columbus, OH 43209

Freedman, Norman
1249 Lisa Ann Dr.
Akron, OH 44313

Brody, Ernie
5200 Three Village Dr. #LLB
Lyndhurst, OH 44124

Friedman, Arthur
7256 Laurel Oak Lane
Cincinnati, OH 45237



Friedman, Jay
Falls Rd.
Hunting Valley
Chagrin Falls, OH 44022

Greenberg, Theodore
100 W. Cold Spring Lane
Baltimore, MD 21201

Fremsen, Sheldon
254 Trade Winds
Palm Beach, FL 33480

Greene, Orville
10 East 40th St.
New York, NY 10016

Garson, Gary
22107 Halburton Rd.
Beachwood, OH 44122

Gruber, Samuel
Regency Towers
3111 Bel Air
Las Vegas, NV 89109

Gillman, Mayer
2444 Madison Rd. #304
Cincinnati, OH 45208

Harr, Bernard
1834 Cromwell Dr.
Akron, OH 44313

Glasman, Ben
26300 Chagrin Blvd
Beachwood, OH 44122

Helman, Jerry
Helman Co.
Box 5129
Akron, OH 44313

Gold, Baron
6281 Coachlite Way
Cincinnati, OH 45243

Hildebrand, Lee
5100 Brownsboro Rd.
Louisville, KY 40222

Goldman, Howard
4 Halycon Ct.
Baltimore, MD 21208

Hirshberg, Gene
3265 Fairhaven Lane
Cincinnati, OH 45237

Goler, Leonard
6500 N.W. 2nd Ave. #516
Boca Raton, FL 33431

Isroff, Clifford
1986 Burlington Rd.
Akron, OH 44313

Goodman, Jim
130 S. Merkle
Bexley, OH 43209

Jacobson, Sanford
Suite 2104 Charles Center S.
36 S. Charles St.
Baltimore, MD 21201

Gordon, David
5600 Collins Ave. #12J
Miami Beach, FL 33140

Kahn, Fritz
601 Dunbarton Circle
Sacramento, CA 95825



5

Kahn, Richard
c/o The Jockey Club #904
Miami, FL 33161

Lerner, George
2260 Pinkhan Rd.
Akron, OH 44313

Kaplan, Dr. Stanley
7216 Willowbrook Lane
Cincinnati, OH 45237

Levine, Abe
1050 Progress Ave.
Toledo, OH 43612

Kauffman, Ken
5693 Strathmore Lane
Dublin, OH 43017

Levinson, Donald
4201 E. Monument St.
Baltimore, MD 21205

Kaufman, Albert
5200 Three Village Dr. #1G
Lyndhurst, OH 44124

Levitin, Milton M.D.
125 S. Merkle Rd.
Columbus, OH 43209

Kenmore, Robert
Acquisitions-Horizons
157 East 55th St. #401
New York, NY 10022

Levy, Robert, Jr.
117 East Deshler
Columbus, OH 43206

Klein, Harry
3818 Washington Sq. #8
Louisville, KY 40207

Marks, Edwin
190 E. Galloway Dr.
Memphis, TN 38111

Kramer, Arthur
3609 Anton Farms Rd.
Baltimore, MD 21208

Mayerson, Manuel
7900 Spring Valley Dr.
Cincinnati, OH 45236

Kravitz, Milton
22700 Shaker Blvd.
Cleveland, OH 44122

Meyers, William
1 Deerfield Circle, RR2
Carmel, IN 46032

Kroos, Jerry
485 Spackview #308
Bexley, OH 43209

Mintz, Del
2215 Campus Rd.
Cleveland, OH 44122

Kroot, Joseph
2218 Tam-O'Shanter Ct.
Carmel, IN 46032

Mizrahi, Joseph
355 Carew Tower
441 Vine St.
Cincinnati, OH 45202

Lappin, Robert
3240 Fairhaven Lane
Cincinnati, OH 45237

Morse, William
24039 Shelburne Rd.
Shaker Hts., OH 44122

5

NOVEMBER 1982 CLAMBAKE ATTENDANCE

Moses, Herbert
4016 Sherwood Forest Manor
Toledo, OH 43623

Reaven, George
2365 Covington Rd. #323
Akron, OH 44313

Moss, Bernard
25132 Prairie Dr.
Southfield, MI 48075

Recht, Dave
1006 Bunker Dr.
Akron, OH 44313

Novasel, Howard
22655 Chagrin Blvd.
Beachwood, OH 44122

Rinzler, Allan
5737 Heather Hollow Dr.
Dayton, OH 45415

Pastor, Leon
2444 Madison Rd. #1405
Cincinnati, OH 45208

Rosen, Ruben
190 Presidential Blvd.
Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

Pearlman, Leonard
116 Sagamore Rd.
Cranston, RI 02920

Ruben, Robert
20100 Boca West Dr.
Boca Raton, FL 33434

Peterson, Sidney
29001 Cedar Rd., Suite 428
Cleveland, OH 44124

Sall, David, M.D.
836 Prudential Dr. #251
Jacksonville, FL 32207

Pollock, Herbert, M.D.
1601 Tucson Blvd. #17
Tucson, AZ 85716

Sall, Michael
726 Mt. Moro Rd.
Villanova, PA 19085

Pollock, Sanford
1092 Fountain Lane
Columbus, OH 43213

Sall, Robert
537 General Lafayette Rd.
Marion, PA 19066

Rakin, Edwin
419 Ellendale Dr.
Nashville, TN 37205

Schahet, Sam
400 N. Meridian, Apt. #16J
Indianapolis, IN 46208

Reamer, Paul
7705 Grasty Rd.
Baltimore, MD 21208

Shenk, Sol
434 N. Columbia Ave.
Columbus, OH 43209

5

NOVEMBER 1982 CLAMBAKE ATTENDANCE

Siegel, Dr. Thomas
3533 Amberacres Dr.
Cincinnati, OH 45237

Swedlow, Gerald
153 S. Merkle Rd.
Columbus, OH 43209

Silberstein, Marvin
317 S. Virginia Lee Rd.
Columbus, OH 43209

Swedlow, Robert
9418 Central Park
Evanston, IL 60203

Silver, Harry
Coventry House, Apt. #601
Melrose Park, PA 19126

Wagner, Cyril
16500 N. Park Dr.
Southfield, MI 48075

Silverman, Joseph
222 St. Paul Place #302
Baltimore, MD 21202

Weiner, Earle
24656 Dianne Court
Cleveland, OH 44122

Simmons, Fred
1535 Broadway
Dearborn, MI 48226

Weiss, Peter
650 Noe Bixby Rd.
Columbus, OH 43213

Loloman, Ben
4374 Indian Rd.
Toledo, OH 43515

Winston, Herman
3507 Northridge Dr.
Baltimore, MD 21208

Spitz, I. B.
14387 Washington Blvd.
Iniversity Hts., OH 44118

Yenkin, Ben
1620 E. Broad St. #1602
Columbus, OH 43203

Stein, Raymond, M.D.
275 S. 19th St.
Philadelphia, PA 19103

Yosha, Louis
2220 Meridian St.
Indianapolis, IN 46202

Steiner, Phillip
2444 Madison Rd.
Cincinnati, OH 45208

Youngheart, Sam
4343 W. Bancroft St. #1C
Toledo, OH 43615

Steiner, Rick
4044 Rose Hill Ave.
Cincinnati, OH 45229

Zacks, Barry
72 S. Washington Ave.
Columbus, OH 43215

Stern, Sanford
441 Brookside Dr.
Columbus, OH 43209

Zacks, Gordon
140 N. Parkview
Columbus, OH 43209

NOVEMBER 1982 CLAMBAKE ATTENDANCE

Zahler, Gerald
2853 Fairmount Blvd.
Cleveland Hts., OH 44118

Zetzer, Milton
1236 Lisa Ann Dr.
Akron, OH 44313

