



Abba Hillel Silver Collection Digitization Project

Featuring collections from the Western Reserve Historical Society and
The Jacob Rader Marcus Center of the American Jewish Archives

MS-4787: Abba Hillel Silver Papers, 1902-1989.

Series I: General Correspondence, 1914-1969, undated.

Sub-series A: Alphabetical, 1914-1965, undated.

Reel
38

Box
14

Folder
918

Jewish Agency, Zucker plan, provisional government, 1948
undated.

April 21, 1948.

Executives of the Jewish Agency for Palestine,
Jerusalem, Palestine;

Executives Vaad Le'umi,
Jerusalem, Palestine;

Chairman, American Section, Jewish Agency for Palestine,
16 East 66 Street, New York City;

American Zionist Emergency Council,
342 Madison Avenue, New York City.

In our brief submitted April 5th to the Zionist leadership, both in Jerusalem and in New York, we emphasized the prime importance of proclaiming the Jewish Republic prior to April 16th, before existing Jewish rights could be superseded by subsequent action of the United Nations. Since then a change of profound significance has occurred which radically modified the Zionist position.

We would like to draw your attention to what we think is the key point in the truce resolution adopted by the Security Council during the early hours of April 17th.

Let us recapitulate the situation in the light of recent developments in the United Nations.

When the authorized representatives of the Jewish people agreed to the partition resolution of November 29th, 1947, all former legal claims based on the Balfour Declaration, the League of Nations policy, the Anglo-American Convention of December 3, 1924, became consolidated in the new international law as embodied in the United Nations decision. Whatever rights we asserted under those previous agreements lost their identity in the new merging of rights, duties and obligations.

Events since November 29th have established that the leading proponent of the partition program, the United States, was desirous of withdrawing from the military and economic implications of implementing that policy. A volte face for the leading world power, on a prime policy which it had forced on a skeptical General Assembly, is a painful and humiliating process. The considerations to American statesmen were sufficiently weighty that no amount of present moral or political pressure could sway them from their course. It was done despite the obvious discomfiture of our diplomatic leaders.

Having set the diplomatic course, the United States is compelled to follow through. Vital among its current objectives is to prevent the upsetting of the new program by events over which it exercises no direct control. Among the possibilities envisaged by American statesmen is the assertion by the Jews of their rights accruing under the policy of November 29th, which is still the legal program of the United Nations. Many a diplomat in Washington must have felt immeasurably relieved when April first passed without the proclamation of the Jewish State in Palestine, as the Jews had the right to do under the partition decision.

In order to tie the hands of the Jewish leadership henceforth there was set in motion precisely on April first the international machinery for the reconsideration of the partition program by the body which had fathered it. This move was to have the legal effect equivalent to an estoppel in municipal law; i.e., the interested party negatively affected, namely the Jewish people, moved at its peril from that date on, subject to the mandate of the overriding power from which it had derived its rights. The General Assembly is now in session for the specific purpose of reconsidering the future government of Palestine.

Meanwhile there existed the threat of the March 23rd joint resolution of the Jewish Agency and the Vaad Le'umi that the Jewish State of Palestine would be proclaimed immediately after the British surrendered their Mandate on May 15th. The leaders of organized Jewry made the serious mistake of forgetting that the principal legal authority over the future of Palestine had been changed since November 29th, and that the time-table of the United Nations was to be the decisive element, not that of Great Britain.

It became incumbent on the American statesmen to stalemate the threat of the proclamation of the Jewish State. For this reason the so-called "truce resolution" program was devised. No one knew better than the American Government that the "truce" program could not become effective. It is unlikely that they even desired that the "truce" should be made effective.

THE REAL, THE ONLY RATIONAL, PURPOSE ENVISAGED BY THE "TRUCE RESOLUTION" WAS CONTAINED IN PARAGRAPH FOUR OF ARTICLE ONE, THE SO-CALLED "STANDSTILL" CLAUSE. BY ITS TERMS THERE IS IMPOSED UPON THE JEWISH AGENCY AND THE VAAD LE'UMI THE OBLIGATION TO "REFRAIN, PENDING FURTHER CONSIDERATION OF PALESTINE'S FUTURE BY THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY, FROM ANY POLITICAL ACTIVITY WHICH MIGHT PREJUDICE THE RIGHTS, CLAIMS OR POSITIONS OF EITHER COMMUNITY".

The Jewish world is henceforth put on notice not to go ahead with the plan as proposed on May 15th or thereafter. Should the Jewish State be proclaimed without specific sanction of the special session of the General Assembly, that proclamation would be without validity and of no legal effect. Such a proclamation, in view of the "standstill" provision would constitute a revolutionary act against the authority of the United Nations. That was the secret intent of the movers of the "standstill resolution" in the Security Council.

It is immaterial in the eyes of those diplomats what the General Assembly will do. It does not even have to repeal partition. That plan has already been rendered ineffective by virtue of the "standstill truce resolution". Most probably it will not repeal the decision of November 29th. The Assembly may content itself with limiting its present action to implementing the internationalization of Jerusalem as already determined.

But what the General Assembly will now do is not the paramount question for us Jews. The fact remains that whatever the decision, the partition program has lost its positive, affirmative character, and has become submerged in the maelstrom of international politics. Gone would be the rights so painfully achieved over the past thirty years; in vain would be the sacrifices of our six million martyrs if the purpose underlying the "standstill resolution" is attained.

We have lost the initiative we possessed last Fall. We were then given certain definite rights, and we have failed in their timely exercise.

Fidelity Onion Skin

There is still one last chance to salvage our cause...to turn imminent disaster into glorious victory...to realize the age-old deathless dream of our people for a reconstituted sovereign nation in its own homeland.

STAND BY YOUR RESOLUTION OF MARCH 23RD TO PROCLAIM THE JEWISH STATE!

Rights then postponed were never intended to be surrendered. They should not now be filched. The United Nations and the entire world was then informed that the right to assume Jewish Statehood would be asserted immediately after the surrender of the British Mandate on May 15th by the proclamation of the Jewish State. Whatever action the Security Council took after March 23rd was in direct contravention of Jewish rights conferred by the General Assembly of the United Nations. Let the majesty of justice be proclaimed and its enemies be confounded. Unfurl the banner of the Jewish Republic!

Should you in a tragic moment--which God forbid!-- decide to repeal or otherwise evade the clear import of your pledge and your duty, it will indeed be a grievous day for our people.

But Zionism will not be lost. For the Jews are an immortal people, and as long as there remain Jews, there will always be the hope, the aspiration for a redeemed Zion. But new methods and new tactics will have to be evolved from events as they develop. We will have to re-orient ourselves to the changing world, and bring forth all the latent powers within the Zionist movement for the most effective employment of all our resources--moral, intellectual and political.

With Zionist Greetings,

Morris Zucker

Dr. Morris Zucker
31-04 Steinway Street
Astoria, L.I., N.Y.

Arno Wrazlowsky

Arno Wrazlowsky
50 East 18 Street
Brooklyn, N. Y.

Colbeck

Fidelity Onion Skin

MADE IN U.S.A.

THE CASE FOR A PROVISIONAL GOVERNMENT

We are all agreed that a sovereign Jewish State of Palestine is what we want. We wish you to remember that we are regular disciplined Zionists who have never rebelled against Zionist leadership, except through regular Zionist channels. We want you to know that the case for a provisional government, as proposed by Dr. Zucker, is not a revolt against Zionist policy or an expression of dissatisfaction with the present Zionist Leadership. It is a plan for the extension and improvement of our Zionist party platform. Originally, the Zucker Plan was the property of only Dr. Zucker, but today it expresses the will of an unnumbered element of the Jewish people. These, we think, are basic points of agreement.

We come now to those factors upon which we seek and urge further agreement. They are, in order as follows:

1. The basic validity of the Zucker Plan and the urgent necessity of the American Zionist Emergency Council to adopt it as its party platform.
2. The dynamic elements of the plan are such as to insure an immediate increase in Zionist activity, either with or without approval from the Emergency Council.
3. Regardless of what happens here, regular party discipline should not be invoked to shackle the growth of the movement for its adoption, and

4. An understanding of the political effect the Plan will have upon the Zionist cause.

BASIC VALIDITY

The legal basis for a provisional government is to be found in the language of Article IV of the Mandate. We all know that the Jewish Agency is permitted by the British Government to function as the representative body of the Zionist Organization only so long "as its organization and constitution are in the opinion of the Mandatory appropriate".

We do not desire and we are all agreed it is not advisable for the Jewish Agency to do anything now which can give cause to the British Government to suddenly decide that the Jewish Agency is no longer "appropriate". The removal of the Jewish Agency, whatever be the cause at this time, would be a major catastrophe, and we must avoid it.

However, the re-establishment of a Jewish State is admittedly a critical necessity. We do not think it necessary to belabor this point. Our six million murdered brothers are sufficient and ghastly evidence thereof.

We are thus caught on the horns of a dilemma. We must not jeopardize the standing of the Jewish Agency, yet we must, in the name of our martyred brothers proceed to reestablish a Jewish State. If the Jewish Agency should itself sponsor and organize the Jewish State, it may well provoke the British Government to withdraw recognition. In such case, we

would then be forced to proclaim a Jewish State anyhow, but with the loss of our only internationally recognized body. What shall we do?

We submit that the Zucker Plan is the answer.

The Jewish Agency is composed of many subsidiary organizations such as ours which are free to adopt policies of their own, sponsor plans they think best, and otherwise function as independent entities. If this be true, then Zionist organizations of this Country can adopt the Zucker Plan as part of their platforms and proceed to establish a provisional government for a Jewish State. We do not think it necessary to enlarge upon the dignity, prestige and influence which such a government will obtain and wield in international affairs, especially when it is supported by the elements presently found in Zionist ranks. Sponsorship by the American Jewish People for a provisional government will probably have immediate success and may deter England from any attempt to withdraw recognition of the Jewish Agency; and if withdrawal of recognition is provoked, the provisional government could, with better chance of success, challenge such withdrawal and supported by American public opinion, force de jure recognition. Let us remember that England today also needs friends in, and a considerable measure of support from, the American people.

DYNAMIC ELEMENTS OF THE PLAN

Contained in the Zucker Plan are elements of an unusually dynamic character. It is amazing to us, who are regular disciplined Zionists, how the plan incites activity in old and young, how it unloosens

the pockets of rich and poor, how it brings spark to every discussion and how it elicits sympathy and support from elements which have never before been associated with Zionism. It appeals to those who know --- and who don't --- of our six million murdered brothers. It appeals even stronger to those who nourish anti-British sentiment and their number is not inconsiderable. We suggest that it will appeal, tragically enough, to those governments who may wish to get rid of their Jewish constituents.

The mere claim of statehood, although it be one of a provisional character, has already evoked a tremendous response from those to whom the plan has so far been brought. The proportions of this response is limited only to the extent that it has been publicized. We feel that with proper sponsorship, such as the regular Zionist organization can bestow, it can inflame the entire Jewish world, and perhaps the world-at-large.

There is one thing, as the German General Staff itself admitted, which cannot be measured, and that is the "Commotion of the Popular Soul". Given sufficient cause for an outburst, the Popular Soul can be excited to such an extent as to over-ride and overwhelm the best-laid plans of any man or group of men. We think, indeed we are convinced, that the Zucker Plan has in it the necessary dynamic elements to explode the Popular Soul out of its stupor and we feel that the movement can elicit from the world-at-large a response of proportions sufficient to overwhelm the interests of the imperialists and expose the stupidity of the assimilationists.

All this points to the following: That when the Zionist organizations approve and sponsor the Zucker Plan, the probable growth of its

support will be of such momentous and historic proportion that it can serve only the best interests of our people. It might well attract many elements in Jewish life not now inside the Zionist fold and it will coalesce and solidify the ranks already inside the Zionist fold.

Most of all, however, the plan will give a positive uplift and impetus to Zionism, such as it has not enjoyed since the Mandate. We feel convinced that it will rehabilitate European Jewry, put an immediate end to our statelessness and provide for Zionism a positive impulse as opposed to the negative impulse provided by Hitler.

REGULAR PARTY DISCIPLINE

As you know, and as we have stated, we are and have been regular disciplined Zionists. Whenever we have previously had any cause for complaint concerning Zionist affairs we registered them inside our Zionist Organization. The present appeal is in similar style, being an expression of regular sincere Zionists who desire to have their thoughts adopted as part of the policy and platform of our Zionist Organization.

However, there are contained in the Zucker Plan dynamic explosive elements which may well lead regular Zionists to unshackle themselves of party discipline and desert the party line they have previously followed with consequent danger of disunity in Zionist ranks. A certain amount of momentum is already behind the movement for its adoption and this momentum must be harnessed to the Zionist cause, lest disunity result.

This result must be avoided. If a full understanding be had and an accurate measurement be made of the power contained in the Zucker Plan we may prevent such disunity from occurring. Up to the present time, the plan and its sponsorship has been in the control of tried and tested Zionists, but it is not inconceivable that the plan might inflame irresponsible Zionists who may wish to create, for reasons of their own, another organization to compete against us for the support and good-will of the American Jewish public. We urge therefore serious consideration of its explosive qualities so that whatever be our judgment thereon, it be made with a full understanding of the facts.

POLITICAL EFFECT

Assume for the moment that the tempest which the plan will engender, be insignificant. If such be its fate, which we doubt, nothing can be lost by the effort. In fact to the extent that we shall disseminate additional Zionist propaganda, it will be a profitable adventure, for the Jewish Agency, our only internationally recognized authority, can certainly disclaim us because, as we have pointed out it should not and need not officially support us.

Assume for the moment that the plan will engender a sizeable movement which can compete successfully for the good-will and support of the American people at large. If such be the fate, good, because then the Jewish Agency can better determine whether or not it should officially take over and sponsor the provisional government. If it does decide to do

so, we will then be able to turn over to the Jewish Agency a provisional government more or less able to stand on its own feet.

Assume for the moment that the plan will engender a movement of such proportions as to overwhelm imperialists and over-ride the assimilationists. We need not contemplate or measure the effects thereof, but merely to hope that it actually happens.

CONCLUSIONS

1. The Zionist Organizations in America should adopt the Zucker Plan and set in motion the machinery to create the provisional government of the Jewish Republic of Palestine.

2. If, in the considered judgment of the American Zionist Emergency Council, such sponsorship should be deemed inexpedient, --- then give to the Zucker Plan and the movement for its adoption, your unofficial, sub-rosa blessing and allow it an opportunity to test its validity and strength among the masses.