



Abba Hillel Silver Collection Digitization Project

Featuring collections from the Western Reserve Historical Society and
The Jacob Rader Marcus Center of the American Jewish Archives

MS-4787: Abba Hillel Silver Papers, 1902-1989.

Series V: Writings, 1909-1963, undated.

Reel
187

Box
71

Folder
1073

On balance of life, undated.

Plato (430-347?)

a long national struggle. Peloponnesian War. Athens
conquered 403. Rule of Thirty - Eur. restored - Variety
of pol. developments.

① Republic (2) Timaeus (3) Critias. = Trilogy.
"Republic" or "Concerning Justice"

Nature of Justice? Best revealed in the perfect state.
By analogy from perfect state - ought recognize justice
individual man.

Perfect state is one in which 3 classes ① Guardians
② Auxiliaries and ③ Producers each does its proper
work. Or. organized on castes. Each keeps
function, & caste with strict order. (Harmony?)
Some men are Gold, others Silver, others iron & copper.
and remain so.

① Guardians = Soldiers = Ruling Class + Philosophy.
= Sophia. = wisdom.

② Auxiliaries - Andria.

Perfect state is an Aristocracy. - most virtuous
and happy.

Discusses 5 kinds of commonwealths

Democracy is lowest - just above Tyranny
harmony - prepares way for Tyranny.

"Plato has no idea either of a social state in which
all classes are harmonized, or of a federation of states

in the world in which diff. nations or states have a
place" (Jowett's Plato I p. 225.)
P's Republic largely modelled after Sparta = a military State
P. favored community of goods. Bk III - compared
to Guardians. Aristotle condemns it. - ① express of
industry & does away with spurt, honor, beauty.
So also with early Christians - council, prophe-
tion.

No immediate application to practice.

II Community of wives and children. Family is national
element of state.
- Parents are not to know their children -
III Occupation of men & women. the same = war
= equality of
sexes.

Same training & education

Family ties less strong > friendship
a country.

= Extreme View
no diff. bet
men & women.

IV. Cruelty to weak

V. "crudest animalism" in
his ideal commonwealth.

VI. Overwhelmed with idea of the State.
only one org. is desirable the political
i.e. the military. All suffering
for the needs, war. (like Church in
later ages).

Monastic conception (except children)

= Marriage

Men need
women only
for sexual intercourse.
No tie & affection
to each other.
- Breed like
inferior animals
- Lower than
in animals
would &
prohibit sex
feeling.

"Fails to distinguish & thus from Politics".

"But the movement of a body of men can never have the phrasing & faculty of a single man. The freedom of the indiv. which is always limited, becomes still more weakened when transferred to a nation" (264)
A false analogy.

Confuses harmony of states with harmony of life.

Denounces the Drama, Poetry (all but hymns)

"an ideal of a city in heaven"



On Fasting

Taamit. 22a. רבי, יאסו, אלקי אן חורב רטאו אסר
אג אצטו זאגטו למן, וצריך לזהב ולון הזהב אכחאג אלא
יאמי י' והאדא אמר רב א"ל צ"י יאסו, גמג' יוה וצק ארסל חורב -
נאמה לנמו זק ~~פ~~ פ ח י י י !

The worker - so as not to work less for
his master. (Jerusalem - ch. 7. ³האכה)



Rhis meland

— 31077 73171 127

713107 720.

d. 1213. Spire

Antikn - Antike - fasted every day but xrl.

Some say even xrl. 2 days from Kippen.

Work = compote. of 73171 and his disciples.

Fasting

Quotes R. Jose (Taamot 22b) Not it's worth it

(155) — But all are exaltation 155, 4, 155

(155)

Man who is greatly needed, or teacher, or
~~some~~ public dependant not allowed to worship
himself. (1555 p. 381).



Halevi

17510. Part 2. ch. 50. Opposed to חסידות

אין החסידות וגורם מהם חסידות ואלו 2 כח חסידות. אך
232 חסידות ואלו 2 כח חסידות חסידות חסידות חסידות

much fasting is no "worship" for one whose affections
are meat - & body meat. - how ~~powerful~~
lessening one's income to one who gets it without
at no cost to his ~~spiritual~~ reputation, wisdom
& doing of good. - or to one who needs it
for children -

"Our life is found in אבות אבות
You can reach God thus any day, thus 3.
"Your mortification on fast days is no means
to God & your joy on Sabbath & Holydays".
Joy should have same ענין as Suffering

Condemns us hermits and rebukes severely
Part 3. 1 ff. This is not the Jewish

way! נבון חסידות / חסידות / חסידות / חסידות / חסידות

A true man of faith loves this world & buys it
of years.

In ancient days there was some purpose to
x חסידות / חסידות / חסידות / חסידות / חסידות

To-day no purpose whatever is served

1. Restraint rather than Asceticism.
Self-denial as matter of discipline - to counter-act
 urges towards indulgence - Ancients did not need
 not to pass beyond bounds prescribed by law.

✓ The Law was a check on excessive Asceticism.
 think of God always - be humble etc. etc. (13/28, 18
 תורה. - "פירק" -) but not to become a hermit.

Favors תורה הגדולה -
 אין צדיק הגדולה אלא יושב הארץ ויהיה
 Opposed only to תורה = superfluities, which
 undermine man, physically and spiritually.

I (This is "general" תורה) = wholesome abstinence
 4 There is need for a few to set example, to
 act as "models", mentors. These are completely
 removed from worldly concerns - real sages
 (תורה גדולה)

But תורה הגדולה לא תכלה נאמרה בתורה
 (כחוקה) - שם משה ואלה שמעו וישמעו ואלה שמעו
 (חוקה תורה)
 תורה is only one תורה.

II There is also "Special" תורה = תורה המורה -
 תורה המורה. Purpose to make Reason master
 the appetites, body & soul - which exchange
 man from god. ... ואלה שמעו
 - to keep men from Materialism...

To restore man לְהַחְיֵה אֶת הָאָדָם.
Here too there is need for the exceptional few to
act as examples - physicians, the sages - אֲדוֹנֵי הַדָּבָר
אֲדוֹנֵי הַדָּבָר - they are אֲדוֹנֵי הַדָּבָר
אֲדוֹנֵי הַדָּבָר (Chap. 2)

Has not much sympathy for Hermits - (ch. 3)
who leave the world. Even those who act as
recluses in their own homes. Baabya
despises the true "Jewish" אֲדוֹנֵי הַדָּבָר. (ch. 3) He
comes on the brothers, the world - In his
heart alone is he free from toils & involvement
in material world. אֲדוֹנֵי הַדָּבָר אֲדוֹנֵי הַדָּבָר
אֲדוֹנֵי הַדָּבָר. # olds this world & its wealth in
light esteem. Think of eternal life and take
from this world whatever fits them for next.

- אֲדוֹנֵי הַדָּבָר אֲדוֹנֵי הַדָּבָר אֲדוֹנֵי הַדָּבָר -

Describes ideal man = ch. 4.

No celibacy - fasting & self mortification

Not to regard labor as deferment to perfect
life - (Just Hillel, Shammai, also Hekiah). (ch. 5)

Drink water, preferably, but if in need, wine
drunk sparingly -

Opposed to self-imposed Poverty (like friars)
אֲדוֹנֵי הַדָּבָר אֲדוֹנֵי הַדָּבָר (ch. 5). A man should
take for his own bread -

וְלֹא יִצְלַח לָעֹלָם הַבָּא לֵבָדּוּ לְעַלְמָא דְּהַיּוֹמָא. within bounds, Leen.
(e.g. fast on Sabbath & Holidays - celebrary -) ch. 5

The ancients were wise. They worked for this world
as well as the next. One did not interfere with the
other. וְלֹא יִצְלַח לָעֹלָם הַבָּא לֵבָדּוּ לְעַלְמָא דְּהַיּוֹמָא. Leen ch. 22. 15
אֲנִי הָיִיתִי וְלֹא הָיָה אֵלָּהּ אֶלֶּם וְצִיָּקָה וְלֹא יִצְלַח לָעֹלָם הַבָּא לֵבָדּוּ לְעַלְמָא דְּהַיּוֹמָא.

also Ecc. 7. 18. 'לֹא יִצְלַח לָעֹלָם הַבָּא לֵבָדּוּ לְעַלְמָא דְּהַיּוֹמָא'
⚡ Balance between two worlds!

Look after Body and Soul! (לֵבָדּוּ לְעַלְמָא דְּהַיּוֹמָא וְלָעֹלָם הַבָּא)

מִן אֲזַנְכֵּךְ הִמָּלֵךְ וְלֵבְךָ יִמְנָע וְלֹא תִּשְׁכַּח אֶת צִוֵּי הָאֱלֹהִים.
אֵין אֲנִי פֶלֶךְ מִן הַתְּנִיחִי וְהַמִּלִּיטָה, וְלֹא מִן הַמִּלִּיטָה.

To weaken body is to weaken soul.

⚡ Do not follow the way of the צוּרֵי הַבְּוֹשִׁיט

⚡ מִן הַיָּמִין! וְלֹא מִן הַיָּמִין!
⚡ אֵין הַיָּמִין! וְלֹא מִן הַיָּמִין!

This world feeds the next!

Life takes precedence.

Tosef. Sah. Ch. 15

... ואלו חמשה עשר ...
... ואלו חמשה עשר ...
... ואלו חמשה עשר ...

✓ cf. Jer. Shabbat ch. 4 - when R. Aba bar
Zeimna is rebuked! for not eating
under threat of death.

Also Ben. R. Ch. 82. ואלו חמשה עשר ...



Excessive Emphasis on Intent as against Act. כוונה and תכלית

Interesting controversy

Ben. 17. ב' העולם (מלכה) ללוא ולמך נאח' א' ללוא
שני

See also Nez. 23. הלל אומר ואדם ללוא ואם פסחיה
היה עזרה. שני תלמי וכו' וכו' וכו'
אמר מלכה ללוא ולמך
אמר יוסף ואדם עזרה למלכה - כך נהנה ואם 27
ואם ללוא ולמך למלך ללוא ולמך

= middle course

אמר ואין ללוא נאח' - R. H. 28

— the other extreme



Arg. too much mysticism

1) Hag. 11b. 'וזהו זמנו של וכו' (This is a Mistake) (ספר האקזיסטנציאליזם)

2) Tan. de Sh. 12. כוונתו של הקדוש ברוך הוא

3) ^{4x} Jer. Hag. Ch. 2. והיה זהו זמנו ... (הוא זמנו של הקדוש ברוך הוא)

4) Hag. 14-15 ... וזהו זמנו של הקדוש ברוך הוא

5) ^{xy} Hag. 13a (Justing Ben Siran) ^{(3,21-22)²³} זמנו של הקדוש ברוך הוא
אזכור זמנו של הקדוש ברוך הוא
וזהו זמנו של הקדוש ברוך הוא

So also in Jer. Hag. Ch. 2 part 1.

" " Ber. R. Ch. 5

7 different versions.



See פ. 8 חמור

(+ Kindness)

Against Excessive Piety & Righteousness

אין גוהי צדוק היכה ואל גמחם ואלו איה אלאום. Ecc. 7. 16-18
אל גוהי היכה

אם הגמח מן הצדק ואם הוא אמתה (פ.ל.) - Ezra comment
והצדק אדם אלאום. והצדק אדם אלאום. הוא אלאום. הוא אלאום. הוא אלאום.
(Hermit) הוא אלאום אלאום אלאום.

Same tried to be too good! (yoma 22a)

Principle of Balance אלאום אלאום אלאום אלאום אלאום אלאום
אלאום אלאום אלאום אלאום אלאום אלאום (v. 18)

אלאום אלאום אלאום אלאום אלאום אלאום
רחמים/ (Koh. R. 233)

Jer. Sah. ch. 1 אלאום אלאום אלאום אלאום אלאום אלאום

Tanf. Yeh. ch. 1 אלאום אלאום אלאום אלאום אלאום אלאום
חמלך הולך (R. 3. 14)

Too much Honey

Proh. 25.16 .. כל מילה ואל זיק, בן גלגל וקהל

Nothing in excess

San. 29.

ל המס, קור

Be. R. Ch. 19. לל מלה ואל הקצו, למי מן הדק.

R. 30.6. ואל מוסר ל 23 ה,

Not too rigorous

Hor. 3.

יין ז'צין דורה א הכלל ואלו מקבן 2
ה כלל ינא יק / ואל 2 ה

also Jer. Sab. ch. 1.

Custom multiplies law

Jer. B. M.

מנהי מלל הלכה

Succah 35.

הא כמנהי המצוה

Against Asceticism - β1210 -

See "Rob. An. theology". chap 25.

The Nazirite, hee. he abstained from wine - needed to make
atone ment.

R. Joshua and the movement towards Asceticism after
the Destruction, Temple.

Against too much holiness - (breaking 7 Eless at
wedding)

Attitude towards Wine and strong Drink -

"He that fasts is called a sinner".

"He .. refrains from wine is called a sinner"



Against Intellectualism

162 1/216 1,111111 . San. 106 h. (Rab. Anthol. p. 492.

Doeg + Ahitophel were able to ask 400 questions re-
lative to a saying Talmud. Raba! 2,102,101 1/117



Is. 66.

וְכֵן הָיָה

Deut. 4.

וְכֵן הָיָה וְכֵן הָיָה

פסוק זה מביא לידי תיבה. El. Ch. 2

See Am. 5th - Ethics - Ch. 13 & Deut. 10
on neither riches nor poverty

See Deut. 30 - וְכֵן הָיָה וְכֵן הָיָה

Pr. 30.8

וְכֵן הָיָה וְכֵן הָיָה
AMERICAN JEWISH ARCHIVES

✓ P. 31 x 378 - Chap. 16 - למה אלהים ברוך
to lack of speculation about God etc.
and exercises - Both as book.
discourages blind faith - as well as pure
Rationalism

See also Ch. 25. But. cannot be seen

הארה בלבן 5275

See Heim 655 / 161 3111 / תכנה מ

~~ND-22~~
ND-22

on "Balance" in
life



Balance - in Honouring -

Ch. 4- אנה קרי אלה

והוא וגם זה אמר כי אהא... ואלו כלומר... וז' וז'...
ואה זה אהא ואלו... זה אהא קרי



Myth of Gargans - Mahabharata - War - ^{+ conflict & unshakable}
symbol - Gandiva - The celestial bow - in hands of
Dhananjaya. - | Both throw away at
end.

King Arthur - 'Excalibur'

War + Renunciation - (Yoga) Krishna + Brahman!

Killers!

Myth / Hebrews - Abraham. Isaac - Jacob - no Sunder
contrast with Esau -

Wives!



Christian Communities
F. H. D. as with Plato very well —
Sir Thomas More. (See his Utopia p. 144.) "Christ
instituted all things common." (p. 67 & 68)
agrees with Plato.

Communities of men & children also in
"City of the Sun" - Campanella - Domus dei
(1568-1639).

